UNIVERSIDAD DE QUINTANA ROO

División de Ciencias Políticas y Humanidades

ANALYSIS OF A TRANSLATION THROUGH TWO DIFFERENT METHODS: VINAY AND DARBELNET'S AND JOSEPH MALONE'S

TRABAJO MONOGRÁFICO

Para obtener el grado de

LICENCIADO EN LENGUA INGLESA

PRESENTA

Ana Karen García Peña

Supervisores

M.T.I. Argelia Peña Aguilar

M.C. Alessio Zanier Visintin

M.C. Sonia Teresita Sansores Valencia

Chetumal, Quintana Roo, Diciembre de 2011

UNIVERSIDAD DE QUINTANA ROO

División de Ciencias Políticas y Humanidades

Trabajo monográfico elaborado bajo la supervisión del comité de asesoría y aprobada como requisito parcial para obtener el grado de: **Licenciatura en Lengua Inglesa**

COMITÉ DE SUPERVISIÓN

Supervisor: _____

M.T.I. Argelia Peña Aguilar

Supervisor: _____

M.C. Alessio Zanier

Supervisor: _____

M.C. Sonia Teresita Sansores Valencia

Chetumal, Quintana Roo, México, diciembre de 2011.

Dedication

I dedicate this monograph to my parents who have supported me, and who, even through hardships have been there for me and have always been pillars from beginning to end. This is the completion of another one of your legacies.

To my aunt Argelia because I don't think I would have made it without her. I don't think I could fit in just one page how grateful I am to you. You are a role model.

To my grandparents, your caring words and advice have been and will be my stronghold. I couldn't have asked for a better family.

To my family, my great-grandma, my aunts, and uncles, being together is what we do best.

To my teachers, who through my college years have guided me and have given me counsel. Many of you do not know the magnitude of the influence your presence has left in my formation.

Contents

INTRODUCTION

Introduction

This monograph deals with a deep analysis of the final translation based on Vinay and Darbelnet's Methods of Translation, and on Joseph L. Malone's translation taxonomy. The translated texts are two articles from a book on contemplative education, *The Contemplative Life and the Teaching of the Humanities* and *Meditation and Education: India, Tibet, and Modern America*. Contemplative education is an approach to learning that, unlike mainstream education, has a long term scope; it focuses on the development in the student of noble qualities such as peacefulness, internal calm, compassion, and empathy, among other qualities. However, this approach also aims to enhance   the students learning and academic performance just as in any other approach in the field of education (Garrison Institute Report, 2005).

> It is critically important for students to learn mindfulness/awareness so they can […] learn to reflect, learn to take responsibility for their own choices rather than [maintain] the habit of looking outwards; and learn how the power over their thoughts, words, and actions co-creates their life (Tobbs quoted in Garrison Institute Report, 2005).

This is an approach to teaching that tries not only to convey to the student specific knowledge about a subject, but that also focuses on creating better individuals. These individuals will be aware of their own capacity to evolve so that they can go further and reach their goals. Contemplative education with

its focus on the wellbeing of the student and the awareness which the approach encourages may build opportunities to create open mindedness in the students, thus improving themselves during the process of learning. Contemplative education uses a wide range of contemplative practices throughout this process of learning which includes techniques such as yoga, storytelling, Tai Chi, journaling, music, among others.   Mindfulness meditation, which is often used in contemplative education, may improve the ability to maintain preparedness and oriented attention, and improve the ability to process information more quickly and accurately, while meditation itself can support the development of creativity, it also supports and enhances the development of skills needed for interpersonal relationships, and may help cultivate self-compassion (Shapiro, Brown & Astin, 2008).

The translation of this text was requested by a professor who intends to use it for further research in this field; she has previously worked with the contemplative approach in classrooms and found satisfactory results as you will see below. Considering this, she is in need of texts that can enhance the ideas of this approach to new students interested in this field. The resulting translation of the two chapters *The Contemplative Life and the Teaching of the Humanities* and *Meditation and Education: India, Tibet, and Modern America* will be used for teaching purposes and as an aid in a current research which deals with contemplative education. This is a budding field in education in Mexico and as such, little information is available for its study and, more importantly, for its teaching and for the spreading of its principles

and guidelines. It will also be put to use at the University of Quintana Roo, where some professors, who have been doing research about this approach, have also been using it to teach their students, considering that this young university allows them to experience new approaches to education with their students within the mission and philosophy of the university (Peña, 2010). They have reported positive results from their students during the time they have been using this approach to learning which in the case of English language students, as an example, exhibited in a greater comfort speaking the target language (Mackler J., Peña A., & Camacho K., 2008). When a text is translated into another language that text will become available for a whole new audience and the knowledge and content that it will provide will change and enrich the culture that is now able to understand it. A translator is someone who can spread knowledge and that, with his work, opens possibilities for an interchange of ideas and culture. The process of translation involves dealing with different ideas and putting words together until you find the ideal meaning. It is a process where one has to be faithful to the original version and yet change some aspects when necessary while staying loyal to the source text. The last is even more important when we talk about texts such as the ones that concern this monograph, a text with classroom purposes, where the content of the text will be deliberately used for spreading new ideas and raising debates.

The process of a translation may seem as an uneventful process, a process that doesn't involve anything more than good intuition and a dictionary. By

having this preconception, translators about to translate a text would endanger the faithfulness of the translation since they would be misjudging the appropriate method to do this task. There is a whole process behind a translation that many are unaware of and that many have tried to explain. A translator needs to be able to take an interrelated set of decisions to complete a faithful translation (Haywood, Hervey, & Higgings, 1995). In this monographic study the translator will determine, using Vinay and Darbelnet's and Malone's taxonomy, which strategies or methods have been used during the translation of the text in order to solve some difficulties encountered during the elaboration of the final version. Analyzing the findings and even contrasting both methods, if necessary, would assist in establishing what constitutes a translation and how the meaning that the original author conveyed is transformed into its equivalent in another language. This will surely be of use as a guide and an example for other students that decide to pursue this modality to obtain the degree or to those who would want to know more about the application of the methods of translation for analytical purposes.

The ultimate purpose of this monograph was to complete a translation of the best possible quality with the aid of these methods. If the author-translator found that certain ideas were not completely conveyed or lacked meaning it was easier to identify the errors in the translation text by using the taxonomy of Malone or Vinay and Darbelnet's, with a scrupulous analysis and, certainly,

with the guidance of professionals in the field like the consultants of this monographic study.

This work also has a personal goal, which is to develop a professional translation where the translator can support the decisions taken based on the analysis that will be made and where what has been learned through the translation courses can be applied. As a student who wants to devote herself to translation in the future and that has only experienced amateur and academic translating, going through a step by step analysis of a translation task of this kind is essential, given that during a translation it is not only the process of translation that takes place but also the research that it entails. All this expands one's knowledge of the language, which is welcome by any translator or student of the English language. Also, as Morry Sofer mentions in his book *The Translators Handbook:* "A professional translator has to be able to translate into more than one area of knowledge. 20/30 fields of knowledge in a year" (2009, p. 33). This might not be the case for the translator at this point, but translating a text in a specific field of knowledge such as contemplative education adds to the translator's expertise and enriches her vocabulary.

A monograph of a translation could be called a self-discovery journey with advantages for everyone directly or indirectly involved. The final aim and purpose will always be the spreading of new ideas, which in this case are also new in the original author's culture. This should be an incentive to keep

translating so that the people who can benefit from it can have these ideas

and meanings in their language that otherwise would be out of their reach.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature Review

For a translation what a translator must first have is a text to be translated. A text is a compound of elements and signs that when correctly interwoven together make an article, a piece of literature, a poem, among many other types of text. The job of a translator is to analyze and dismantle the text to understand it correctly, to grab a hold of their meanings and underlying meanings. After achieving this he/she will be able to convey the meaning and intent of the original work in a correct way. A translator must be able to then convey the message into another set of signs in the target language of similar functions as the ones found in the source text (García, 1989, p. 25). For example, in the case of a literary text the style of the writer must be transferred to the final version with the best of the translator's abilities because this style is what makes an author good or bad and that should be reflected in the translation somehow. Without doing so, and even if the meanings are properly conveyed, the work would be lacking one of its characteristics.

Not long ago, translators could only rely on the testimonies of other translators to guide themselves through the translation task they had to undertake; old testimonies such as Cicerone's or Saint Jerome's (García, 1989, p. 30). Nowadays, the practitioners of translation have stated and developed principles for its exercise through the many years this profession has been practiced on earth. They have gathered and discussed and have

come up with different points of view in an ever changing and ever improving field. Saint Jerome once said "[…] that when translating the Greek, apart from when I'm translating the Holy Scriptures, where even the order of the words is a mystery, I don't express words by word, but meaning by meaning." Such a statement made so long ago can summarize what the work of translators has always been and what the final purpose is (García, 1994). There have been many works that go beyond the passing of time and that by the standards of that time would have seem faithful to the original text, but that compared with a translation of the same text by the current standards would seem inaccurate and obscure. This is due to the fact that there was an emphasis at that time on the use of a word by word translation instead of meaning by meaning. This wouldn't fit the standards of the current translation principles. Translation is an ever changing field.

Through the years translators and linguists have developed some theories on translating methods. Having different backgrounds, they identified a variety of techniques that occur during the development of a translation. This way, a technique known with a specific name may have different approaches (Peña A., 2007, p. 16). In *Translation Theories Explained,* Fawcett (1997) makes a distinction of three different approaches to the methodology of translation. The Russian approach leaded by Yakob Retsker and Alexander Shveitse, the American model represented by Joseph Malone, and the Canadian view which is Vinay and Darbelnet's approach. They all share aspects such as

literal translation and borrowing at different levels. This monographic study focuses the analysis on the following two:

Vinay and Darbelnet's Taxonomy

Vinay's and Darbelnet's view has had a considerable influence in the methods of other approaches and it has become the most used method for translation analysis. In contrast with their predecessor, the North American school of Nida, theirs has a wider diffusion due to the fact that it was easier to apply and was more focused the methods (Vázquez-Ayora, p. 254). In their book *Comparative Stylistics of French and English: a methodology for translation* Vinay and Darbelnet propose a taxonomy of procedures for translation which include the following strategies:

1. *Borrowing: This consists of leaving the original word in the source language in the translated text. It is generally used when the target language lacks a concept or because of stylistic reasons. Example: Una hermosa top-model.*
2. Calque: It is a literal translation of a short phrase. Vinay and Darbelnet define calque as "A special kind of borrowing whereby the language borrows an expression from another, but then translates literally all of its elements" (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995, p. 32). As an example, the word *Balompié* is literally translated from the two different words composing *Football*.

3. Literal Translation: This is the most popular of the methods. It consists of a word by word translation with slight necessary changes for the target language. In this example, *She is right* is transferred word by word to the target language with the necessary addition of an article and a preposition, *Ella está en lo correcto.*

4. Transposition: Transposition is a technique in which words are changed from their original grammatical function in the source language to a completely different one in the target language. This is an example of transposition: in *I am doing a translation* the noun *translation* changes into a verb in the target language, *Estoy traduciendo*.

5. Modulation: It is when the translator changes the focus of a sentence without changing the original sense. It can be from a positive focus to negative focus, from passive voice to active voice, a cause for an effect, among other contrasted changes. As an example, the sentence *That's not difficult* is changed from a negative to a positive in the target language, *Eso es fácil*.

6. Equivalence: Equivalence is in this case the perfect transference between phrases, such as proverbs, that can be perfectly conveyed from the source language into the target language with another idiomatic expression of the same semantic level. Example: *To draw the short straw* is an idiom in English which means "To be the unlucky and end up doing an unpleasant job" *Bailar con la más fea* is the known equivalent for this phrase.

7. Adaptation: Adaptation is used when the target language does not have the equivalent to a cultural aspect imbedded in the text from the source language that the target language readers will not be able to understand. Example: _Going the Distance_ is the title of an American movie which was then adapted for Mexican public as _Amor a Distancia_.

8. Amplification: It is the lexical expansion of a term. Amplification refers to the expansion of a term into more to make the idea clearer and more understandable for the target language readers. Example: In the sentence _He stormed out of the room_ stormed has to be amplified to truly transfer the meaning into the target language, _Salió intempestivamente del cuarto._

9. Reduction: When a previously long term can be or is in need to be shortened into a one word idea. As Munday said there are always however, sense losses (2009, p. 40). This is a matter of style. In this example the term Love seat is reduced to just Sofá; still, there is loss of sense since Love seat implies it is a couch for two people and Sofá is an ambiguous term, since it can be interpreted as different types of couches.

Vinay and Darbelnet's procedures are the most used guidelines for the analysis of a translation. They condense the strategies that translators use according to their view. These are organized in a hierarchy from the least complex to the most complex, being amplification and reduction the last ones

of the list. They are generally applied by the translators in a combined manner.

Joseph L. Malone's Taxonomy

Joseph L. Malone is the most outstanding exponent of the American Model. He lists a series of terms to describe the procedures. They consist of one general term and two more specific terms that do not necessarily delimit the more general one:

1. Matching: Substitution and Equation. This technique encompasses a wide array of techniques earlier described by Vinay and Darbelnet. Equation is literal translation while substitution is equal to *equivalence* and *adaptation* (Fawcett, 1997, p. 41). Matching also goes beyond substitution and equation, and when this happens it can be called *borrowing*, *calque*, *prefabricated matching* (equivalence) and *faux amis*. The last being a mistake by the translator.

2. Zigzagging: Divergence and Convergence. Divergence is when a translator stumbles upon a word in the source text which is ambiguous and which encompasses several meanings, but that cannot be conveyed with the same ambiguity in the target language. The translator then has to choose which meaning would fit best in the target language by the context of the text. Convergence occurs when the meaning in the SL includes a specification (i.e. gender or number)

in the meaning that the translator has to turn into a more general meaning of the same root. Zigzagging would be better exemplified in a scenario where the translator has a choice between using divergence or convergence, depending on the context and register of the text.

3.   Recrescence: Amplification and Reduction. Amplification and Reduction are almost self-explanatory. The first consists in adding extra information to the meaning of a culturally-laden sentence so that it can be understood by the target audience. The second consists of the omission of information that may seem unnecessary by the translator given that it might be redundant or of little importance.

4.   Repackaging: Diffusion and Condensation. Diffusion occurs when a meaning that consisted of one word has to be expanded into more so the meaning can be fully conveyed. Condensation, on the other hand, ensues when the original text had a meaning that consisted of several words but that the translator manages to convey fully using just one.

5.   Reordering: Reordering consists in the rearrangement of word structures due to the target and source language having different narrative and stylistic structures. (Duff A.,1989)

The following is a table with examples for the techniques described above.

General Word	Specific terms	Source Language	Target Language	Explanation
Matching	Equation	If you have never heard of him…	Si nunca has escuchado de él…	In equation little change is made to the order of the source text structure when translating into the target language. It is also called literal translation.
	Substitution	Misery loves company.	Desgracia compartida, menos sentida.	Substitution here is represented with an exact equivalent of a saying. Substitution is the equivalent to equivalence, but it also includes, transposition and adaptation.
	*	The already big community of gamers is growing	La ya gran comunidad de *gamers* está creciendo.	Gamers is a word that has become the name for the people who are fanatics of videogames. Matching is Malone's equivalent to borrowing but it also includes fauxs amis, calque, and prefabricated matching.
Zigzagging	Divergence	She is in high school now but her grades are so so.	Ella ya está en secundaria pero sus calificaciones están más o menos.	High school is an ambiguous word due to the fact that in Mexico we make a differentiation of grades for those years when in the United States it is seldom made. High School has a wider and more encompassing meaning than "secundaria" or "prepartoria" but, as the terms are the only ones available in Spanish as correct

				translations, "secundaria" was chosen on this occasion.
	<u>Convergence</u>	A pair of <u>walking shoes</u>…	Un par de <u>zapatos</u>…	Convergence here is presented as a necessary flattening of *walking shoes* to make it just shoes.
Recrescence	<u>Amplification</u>	The turducken is a delicious dish for Christmas eve…	El turducken (<u>Pavo deshuesado relleno de pato deshuesado, el cual de igual manera es rellenado de pollo deshuesado.</u>) es un platillo delicioso para nochebuena…	The information here is necessary since the text does not explain what the turducken is, but it is an important piece of knowledge to understand the text that is being read. For foreign readers who do not know about this traditional dish this is necessary information.
	<u>Reduction</u>	The tortilla, <u>which is a flatbread made with wheat or corn,</u> Scientifics say has…	La tortilla, dicen los científicos ha…	Here we notice the reduction of information that would be superfluous if the text is targeted to Mexican readers.
Repackaging	<u>Diffusion</u>	For this movie many people are <u>coming out of the cupboard</u>…	Para esta película muchas personas <u>han hecho pública su secreta obsesión con Harry Potter</u>…	Coming out of the cupboard is a colloquial phrase in English which would not make sense to foreign readers who do not understand the cultural weight of it. Here, it was necessary to explain what the phrase was about. This is what Vinay and Darbelnet call amplification.

	Condensation	The farmer went out to the fields and <u>worked the land</u> until sunset…	El granjero salía a los campos y <u>labraba</u> hasta el atardecer…	Here, *work the land* is condensed into *labrar* a single word in Spanish conveying the message of those two words. It is also called reduction by Vinay and Darbelnet.
Reordering		Clearly, some form of compensation is required in these cases to avoid translation loss.	Evidentemente, en estos casos se requiere algún tipo de compensación para evitar la perdida de sentido durante la traducción.	Reordering consists of a change in the order of words for a better result in the target language. This way the text sounds more natural.

These are the two approaches in translation that were used for this monographic study. These two are the most popular taxonomies in the field, and were selected with the purpose of studying and comparing different perspectives.

METHODOLOGY

Method

The texts *The Contemplative Life and the Teaching of the Humanities by Brian Stock* and *Meditation and Education: India, Tibet, and Modern America by Robert A. F. Thurman* are two chapters from the book Teachers College Record. The first one deals with what the humanities are now and, from the point of view of the author, what they actually should be. It provides historical background on how the humanities started to focus onto the written culture instead of the human itself. It states how the contemplative life separated from the "mainstream" education among other aspects. The second article consists of an explanation, with some detail of the goals of meditation, its aims, and the contemplative states that people would achieve if following the contemplative life. It is also related to the previous chapter in that it includes the humanities as a subject in universities and agrees with the view that the humanities are in reality something that deals with the person's welfare and mental state.

During the translation, the use of several instruments was of utmost importance. Translators must have a wide arrange of reference sources that they have acquired through their research skills; without that even the best of the translators wouldn't be able to achieve a faithful translation of the text (Sofer 2009, p. 33) Online dictionaries were the main source for equivalent terms in the target language (Spanish). *Wordreference* is a bilingual

dictionary website that includes different forums for the discussion of issues related to specific words and phrases which meanings are not contained in the common entries and cannot be easily found in a regular dictionary. This is one of the greatest assets of this online dictionary. The translator made use of this feature with one especially difficult term encountered during the translation of the text; it also encompasses a wide variety of phrasal verbs, entries from the Oxford dictionary, an English monolingual dictionary, and a verb conjugator in different languages. Another dictionary that was used was the one of the *El mundo* website, a simple yet useful monolingual Spanish dictionary that, among other functions has a synonyms choice, very useful when looking up different words for the same concept. *Thesaurus.com* is a valuable site for the search of synonyms in English. It provides a list of entries that match with the keyword that has been entered, with additional information about the synonyms and short definitions so that the translator can discriminate which one would fit best. The website of *La Real Academia Española* is the best monolingual dictionary for Spanish words; it provides entries that have been approved by the Spanish academy and was useful to find words that would be more acceptable for the translation into Spanish, that is, the ones that get closer to their equivalent word in English. This website also includes *El diccionario panhispánico de dudas* which was useful with orthographic doubts that emerged. Glossaries of terms specific to the field of contemplative education and meditation were also used. One of these was *Siddha Yoga* which contains explanations of specific terms relevant to meditation and the theory surrounding it. The translator also consulted with

experts in the field of translation in order to clarify concepts and phrases in Spanish that she concluded were not conveying the original message in English. The translator consulted with the professor who requested the translation of the texts as well; she provided explanations for terms that were difficult to grasp and helped the translator to understand the contemplative education approach to better transfer the message of the texts.

A translator must keep in mind certain aspects that are implied in the process of translation. The translator must, first, recognize the type of text he/she will be dealing with, this way the translator will know if specialized vocabulary is needed to complete the task. In the case of the original texts for the elaboration of this monograph, the translator can state they were technical. The translator observed terms and words that are specifically employed in the contemplation domain and required specialized sources of information, as well as advice from the specialist, so she could provide possible meanings to some of these terms. A translator must be aware of the register as well. One must know who will read the translated text due to the fact that the wording needs to be shaped in a way so that the readers will be able to understand it all, and not just certain parts. It must be consistent as well, maintaining a register similar to that of the source text.

There are several steps in the process of translation which were not documented in the monograph but that were important to consider since following them would result in an accurate translation. In the first stage of the

translation process the translator did a first reading of the text to get the general message the original author was trying to communicate within the whole text. The translator did not start the translation immediately, but did a second reading where troublesome words and phrases were found and written down, words that were later tackled with a more detailed research of the word or with the aid of a professional in the field who guided the translator in the process of finding the correct meaning of the word. After the second reading was done, a first draft of the translation was written down, this resulting translation was then modified and polished up into the final translation that is included in this work for its analysis.

The analysis consists of two parts; one section will be devoted to the assessment of Vinay and Darbelnet's methods as the solution in translating some difficult phrases or words. The second section will address Joseph L. Malone's taxonomy as the answer to troublesome phrases or words from the source text. The aim is to compare both approaches for translating, as well as to identify the best ways to reach a precise work in translation. The analysis took place after the translation had been completed and the final version in Spanish was found satisfactory. The analysis determined which strategies or methods the translator used in the different cases found during the process of translation, highlighting the most difficult examples and explaining why certain words or phrases were chosen. It is very important that the translator can justify the choosing of words and the selection of the

strategy used according to the texts *The Science of Linguistics in the Art of Translation* by Joseph L. Malone and Comparative stylistics of French and English: a Methodology for Translation by Jean-Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet. Finally, some conclusions were written, based on the analysis and findings that the translator came up with during the series of actions followed to achieve the final work. The conclusions summarize the most important aspects emerged and, when needed, a comparison between the two methods used for the analysis of the translation is made in order to provide a better insight of the work presented.

This is a table of the phrases that were chosen to be analyzed in this monograph:

1. Meditation translates from the Sanskrit **dhyana**, **bhavana** and even **samadhi**,
2 Make the mistake of investing heavily in **hardware** possibilities and thus neglect the extraordinary **software** developed over millennia…
3. He held the *Chaire Internationale* at the Collegé of France
4. "inner sciences," as they are often called,
5. Though we Euro-Americans like to think…
6. The roots of this approach, which insists that education deal with the whole person,
7. When we talk about reintroducing the contemplative life into the humanities,
8. The pursuit of the contemplative life normally takes place within an **accompanying** belief system.
9. There has also been a growth of interest in religion, **which** has taken shape of reviving dormant meditative traditions.

10. There has also been a growth of interest in religion, **which has taken the shape of reviving dormant meditative traditions**
11. Its tolerance of individual liberation were **not easily** duplicated in other countries where conditions were harsher.
12. The contemplative marked that civilization in every way.
13. Maharishi Mahesh Yogi from trascendental meditation has tried to organize contemplative **SWAT teams** to travel to trouble spots
14 They range from basic **scanning** mindfulness meditation, through critically penetrating insight meditations…
15. In a social framework wherein **I** and **we** live together in community
16. This must be carried out in an impeccable manner, not only because of the **surrounding** suspicion but also…
17. Make the mistake of investing heavily in **hardware** possibilities and thus neglect the extraordinary **software** developed over millennia…
18. If I ask a room full or **Americans** to meditate for cultural, religious, or spiritual reasons,
19. **Native**, feminist, and ecological thinking has contributed to this renaissance.
20. They range from basic **scanning** mindfulness meditation, through critically penetrating insight meditations…
21. If I ask **a room full** of Americans to meditate for cultural, religious, or spiritual reasons,
22. Meditation is used increasingly to help prevente and **treat heart disease**, autoinmune disorders, chronic long disease,
23. When we feel we've lost it, need more of it, can improve our health with it, can generate well-being with it, **what is this "it"?**

In the analysis section these phrases will be accompanied by the page number in which they are located in the source text or target text (example: S1760 / T9), this way these pieces of text can be easily identified if the reader would like to do so.

TRANSLATION

La vida contemplativa y la enseñanza de las humanidades

Brian Stock

University of Toronto

La meditación hoy en día contribuye a la medicina mental/física y a algunas ramas de la psicología educativa. En épocas medievales y antiguas, estas funciones formaban parte del plan de estudios de las humanidades tal y como se enseñaron en escuelas filosóficas, comunidades monásticas y universidades. En este artículo se afirma que si se regresara a una visión holística de las funciones de las humanidades a través de las disciplinas meditativas, la utilidad y el valor de éstas podrían ser integrados con mayor éxito en la vida y en las instituciones occidentales. Si se implementara esta perspectiva de la meditación, los maestros en el área de humanidades tendrían mucho que aprender de las investigaciones en las neurociencias cognitivas.

En años recientes, la meditación ha estado disfrutando de una considerable popularidad en la medicina y la psicología. También ha habido un incremento de interés en la religión, y esto se ha manifestado en la resurrección de tradiciones meditativas (ej. catolicismo romano) o la importación de tradiciones extranjeras (ej. prácticas budistas dentro del judaísmo.) Las ideas feministas, ecologistas y autóctonas han contribuido a este resurgimiento. Como resultado, una gran cantidad de personas se ha sentido atraída hacia las actividades contemplativas por primera vez.

Hasta la fecha, las humanidades han desempeñado un papel relativamente menor en este discurso a pesar del indudable hecho de que una de las disciplinas de las humanidades, la religión, es la fuente de todo lo que sabemos con respecto a prácticas meditativas tradicionales. Desde mi punto de vista, esta situación es poco probable que cambie a corto plazo. Como lo expuso el filósofo Edmund Husserl (1965): El "interés teórico" de las humanidades debería estar de preferencia "dirigido hacia los seres humanos como personas,

hacia sus vidas y actividades personales" y a "los resultados concretos de estas actividades" (p. 150). En la práctica, sin embargo, los maestros de humanidades se ocupan casi exclusivamente del análisis de textos (o con materiales originales que pueden ser discutidos a través de teoría literaria). Las opiniones han cambiado radicalmente a través de los años sobre cuál es el mejor procedimiento interpretativo, pero ninguna rama importante de las humanidades incluye el estilo o las metas de la meditación.

Husserl estaba convencido de que, para su época, las disciplinas que se ocupaban de la cultura habían entrado en una profunda crisis. Muchos profesores de humanidades en escuelas y universidades contemporáneas estarían de acuerdo, y reconocerían que las cuestiones centrales han pasado por cambios importantes desde 1935, cuando su célebre crítica fue escrita. Husserl fue uno de los pocos filósofos del siglo XX cuya visión unificada de las humanidades creó un lugar significativo para la actividad contemplativa dentro de una visión laica del mundo. A medida que el estudio de las humanidades se ha vuelto cada vez más fragmentado, ha habido un creciente coro de voces pidiendo por algún tipo de visión más comprensiva. Lo que los críticos piden, entre otras cosas, es un tipo de educación que enseñe a los estudiantes cómo "vivir como persona… en un marco social donde el *yo* y el *nosotros* vivan juntos en comunidad y tenga a ésta como horizonte": Quieren que las humanidades se enfoquen en "Tener un propósito en la vida, manifestar creatividad espiritual en el sentido más amplio, crear cultura dentro de una continuidad histórica" (Husserl, 1965, p. 150).

Las raíces de este enfoque, las cuales insisten en que la educación debe enfocarse íntegramente en la persona, yacen en creencias antiguas. Solía estar de moda creer que la antigua filosofía griega era el prefacio de la lógica moderna y del método científico. Los expertos hoy en día reconocen que la filosofía también trataba con un amplio espectro de cuestiones contemplativas, las cuales incluían la generación de autoconocimiento a través de ejercicios espirituales o intelectuales. Esta interpretación es particularmente acertada para la última parte del periodo antiguo, cuando la filosofía griega fue enriquecida por temas Judeo-Cristianos. Unido a la instrucción oral, es decir, al intercambio directo entre maestro y estudiantes, este tipo de reflexión alcanzó sus metas a través de la consistencia de sus argumentos y a través de su habilidad para tratar las necesidades morales y éticas de

una comunidad. Los ejercicios con los cuales los individuos se preparaban para este desafío no eran áridos y abstractos, a pesar de ser sumamente cognitivos; estaban enfocados a desarrollar el intelecto y, por ese medio, a transformar la vida.

Hay poca meditación formal en el pensamiento antiguo. Tampoco se habla mucho sobre ello en el antiguo o nuevo testamento. La práctica meditativa realmente llega a su cúspide en la última parte de la época antigua y en la época medieval, llegando a su mayor punto de desarrollo antes del siglo XII; debe gran parte de sus ideas originales a los padres del desierto y a autores de monasterio. Plotinus, el último gran pensador pagano (270 d.c.), dio un lugar prominente al ascenso contemplativo dentro de un esquema neoplatónico. Sus ideas fueron retomadas por San Agustín en un intento de unificar la lectura oracional y las actividades contemplativas; estos métodos, en cambio, eventualmente influenciaron las prácticas devocionales protestantes y católicas. El formato occidental tradicional, el cual ya se había consolidado en el siglo IV, incorporaba prácticas meditativas en el estudio de escrituras, incluía la meditación como parte de la lectura, aunque manteniéndola separada del formato. En un segundo plano se encontraban los hábitos de estudios del cristianismo judío y en última instancia del judaísmo mismo.

Con frecuencia, se sugiere que el fracaso de este enfoque hacia la educación espiritual ocurrió durante la Reforma o la Revolución Científica. En realidad, los cambios decisivos ocurrieron durante los siglos XII y XIII cuando las primeras universidades europeas surgieron de escuelas monásticas y conventos y se comprometieron a completar un programa ampliamente aristotélico en lógica, ciencias naturales y teología. Mucho antes de que Galileo y Newton desafiaran los métodos científicos medievales, los estudiantes dedicados a la vida contemplativa habían abandonado las universidades de Bolonia, Paris, Oxford y Cambridge y buscaron refugio en una variedad de instituciones que congeniaran más con sus actividades, principalmente casas religiosas. Prácticamente ninguno de los "místicos" del temprano periodo moderno –hombres y mujeres que llevaban vidas contemplativas entre la época de Meister Eckhart y Teresa de Ávila- colaboraron en lo que estaba tomando forma como las humanidades modernas. Desde los tiempos de Petrarca, las humanidades modernas estuvieron cada vez más dominadas por la inquietud "humanista" de la exactitud del griego y el latín y con la rehabilitación de una tradición interpretativa

orientada hacia lo escéptico y textual por figuras como Lorenzo Valla, Erasmus y Scalinger. La aparición del libro impreso en un formato estandarizado completó esta transformación, en parte, al favorecer la lectura visual y silenciosa por sobre la práctica de la lectura meditativa y oral. Ya en la época de la reforma, en vez de recluirse de la sociedad por completo como frecuentemente hacían durante la Edad Media, los contemplativos buscaron ocasiones para la contemplación dentro de sus vidas activas. Esta es la situación común actual.

Cuando hablamos sobre reintroducir la vida contemplativa dentro de las humanidades, por lo tanto, debemos tener en claro a qué nos estamos enfrentando. Los métodos de las humanidades han sido extraordinariamente estables por aproximadamente cinco siglos; todos los intentos de introducir alternativas han sido rechazados con éxito. El renacimiento periódico de los estudios religiosos tampoco ha sido capaz de desplazar estas afianzadas ideas, por lo cual una actitud contenciosa no sería exitosa, aunque fuera lo aconsejable. Además, lo que se desea, preferentemente, no es incrementar el interés académico en la meditación (ya hay grupos de especialistas con esos intereses) sino el restablecimiento de una tradición en la cual, en conjunto con el modelo de algunas culturas orientales, las prácticas meditativas y otras actividades intelectuales se apoyen mutuamente; una situación en la cual la persona que medita no se desvía de lo establecido por su cultura, sino que se involucra en algo común y corriente, como mantenerse en forma.

Creo que la mejor manera de alcanzar esta meta es comenzar con un concepto relacionado a la salud integral de la persona. Llamemos a esto el bienestar del individuo. Muchos estadounidenses tienen poco entendimiento de lo que se significa la meditación, pero todos entienden lo que es enfermedad, malestar y sanación. Si son convencidos de que la meditación contribuirá a su salud, podrían aceptar la idea de llevar a cabo una actividad contemplativa en sus vidas diarias. Algunos estudiantes de prácticas contemplativas podrán quejarse de que estoy abordando un problema espiritual a través de medios físicos, pero ambos no pueden ser tratados por separado. Si a las personas se les enseña a meditar, tarde o temprano muchos de ellos descubrirán la dimensión espiritual por sí mismos. En un escenario tradicional, la búsqueda de la vida contemplativa usualmente se da junto con un sistema de creencias. El único equivalente de este tipo de fe en la sociedad contemporánea

podría ser la confianza que se le tiene a la ciencia. Si le pido a un grupo de estadounidenses que mediten por razones culturales, religiosas, o espirituales, es probable que me encuentre en medio de un acalorado debate sobre sus lealtades emocionales e intelectuales. Pero si sugiero que la meditación podría ayudarles a lograr una mejor salud y en última instancia, tal vez, un estado de bienestar, la mayoría pondría en la balanza la evidencia antes de descartar mis argumentos.

Esa evidencia se está reuniendo lentamente. Sin embargo, el estudio de las prácticas meditativas no se puede dar el lujo de quedarse estancado en este aspecto. La noción de enseñanzas de "sabiduría eterna" es algo desorientadora. Carecemos de una colección de evidencia experimental lo suficientemente grande y diversificada que compruebe que los programas de meditación a gran escala proveerán los beneficios que prometen, a pesar del reciente alentador progreso en importantes instituciones médicas. Sabemos que las técnicas de reducción de estrés como la meditación llevan al sistema parasimpático a un estado positivo y la meditación se usa cada vez más para ayudar en la prevención y el tratamiento de cardiopatía, enfermedades autoinmunes, enfermedades pulmonares crónicas, dolores de cabeza, diabetes, eczema, asma, alergias, infertilidad y problemas gastrointestinales, así como también para tratar el pánico, la depresión y la hostilidad. No obstante, se necesitan más estudios para aclarar el efecto de la meditación en relación con otras terapias de cuerpo-mente.

Si vamos de los aspectos clínicos hacia los aspectos culturales de este tema, las dificultades aumentan. Podrá no ser difícil medir los efectos de la meditación prolongada en la presión arterial, enfermedades cardiovasculares y en la reducción del estrés, pero es diferente tratar de determinar su influencia en asuntos vagos como la identidad propia y la de los demás, o la disposición a participar en trabajo comunitario, familiar o colaborativo. No sabemos si la interioridad concentrada puede fortalecer al individuo contra la explotación comercial de los sentidos por parte del los medios de comunicación; aún tenemos que determinar su efecto en la predilección de los individuos por la agresión, la violencia, el comportamiento social anormal y la destrucción del medio ambiente. Aún no hemos descifrado una mayor cantidad de vínculos con el desarrollo de la confianza, paciencia, generosidad y amor. Si no se genera alguna clase de evidencia científica sobre

estos y otros asuntos relacionados, no creo que la meditación tenga una participación duradera en la vida y pensamiento estadounidense.

Al final de este largo camino yace lo que nos referimos como educación de las humanidades para adultos jóvenes en la sociedad estadounidense. Si la actividad contemplativa contribuye a su bienestar y los ayuda a entrar en un estado de ánimo que mejora su habilidad de enfrentarse a una variedad de problemas que van desde la salud hasta su sentido de pertenencia con la comunidad, entonces es de suponer que las tradiciones contemplativas deberían tener un lugar más amplio en los programas educativos. Y si ese fuera el caso, debemos enseñar a nuestros estudiantes sobre qué trata la actividad contemplativa. Entre otras cosas, deben ser instruidos en lectura literaria contemplativa, no de la manera en la que ellos leerían los poemas modernos, obras, o novelas, sino hacerlo como los contemplativos las leen, usando los textos como un medio para un fin y no considerarlos, como es la moda en la práctica literaria moderna, como el fin en sí. También tendrían que explorar otros tipos de meditación, diferentes a las tradiciones Judeo-Cristiana que no requieren la presencia de textos, imágenes u otros apoyos sensoriales. Más allá de eso, los maestros de humanidades tendrían que aprovechar el renovado interés en la vida contemplativa para iniciar una exploración de lo que se conoce como "la identidad moderna"; es decir, un medio para "darle seguimiento a las varias tendencias de lo que significa ser un agente humano, una persona, o un yo" (Taylor, 1989, p.3). Esto implica ampliar la discusión de la ética más allá de los reducidos confines tradicionales de la especulación académica y retomar conexiones culturales tales como historia religiosa, orientación de género y reflexiones ecológicas. Charles Taylor (1989) señaló que mucha de la filosofía moral contemporánea "ha tendido a enfocarse en lo que es correcto hacer, en vez de enfocarse en lo que es bueno ser; en definir el contenido de la obligación en vez de definir la naturaleza de la vida buena; y no hay lugar conceptual libre para una noción de lo bueno como objeto de nuestro amor y lealtad" (p.3). Dentro de las humanidades, ese es un desafío muy importante.

Referencias

Husserl E. (1965). *Phenomenology and the crisis of philosophy, trans. Q. Lauer.* New York: Harper and Row.

Taylor C. (1989). *Sources of the self: the making of the modern identity.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

BRIAN STOCK enseña historia y literatura en el Departamento de Inglés en la Universidad de Toronto. Ha escrito varios estudios que tratan sobre las tendencias de percepción entre los periodos clásico y moderno temprano. Entre estos se incluyen *The implications of Literacy (1981),* un estudio del ascenso del entendimiento literario durante la edad media, y *Augustine, the Reader (1995),* en el cual trata la relación entre la lectura, la meditación y las éticas de interpretación en la edad antigua tardía. En 1999, impartió las cátedras de Rosenbach en la Universidad de Pensilvania sobre lectura, meditación y la historia de la medicina cuerpo-mente. Impartió la *Chaire Internationale* en Collège de France de 1999 a 2000, y en 2001 fue Profesor Sather de literatura clásica en la Universidad de California en Berkeley.

Meditación y educación: India, Tíbet y los Estados Unidos en la actualidad.

ROBERT A. F. THURMAN

Columbia University

En este artículo se estudian las tradiciones asiáticas de la meditación, con especial atención en el budismo, tal y como fue desarrollado en la antigua India. Se define un plan de estudios común, inicialmente desarrollado en instituciones monásticas de educación superior y que ha sido preservado en el Tíbet. Posteriormente se explora cómo este plan de estudios podría ser adaptado de modo que pueda ayudar a sostener una educación verdaderamente humanista dentro de la educación superior estadounidense. Esta investigación se enfoca no sólo en los inherentes valores de la meditación budista sino también en las estrategias prácticas que pueden ser utilizadas para introducir estos valores en el plan de estudios académico y en la vida universitaria en general.

I. **¿Qué es "meditación"? ¿Qué es la "mente contemplativa"? ¿Qué es "esto" que sentimos que hemos perdido, que necesitamos mas de él, que podemos mejorar nuestra salud con él, que podemos generar bienestar con él? ¿Cómo es que se perdió en el occidente y el mundo moderno? ¿Quién ha estado a su favor y quién en su contra?**

Es justo decir que la civilización India clásica incorporó la contemplación mucho más que ninguna otra, en ese entonces y ahora. Esta civilización fue marcada por la contemplación en todos los sentidos. Provocó que se desarrollaran sin paralelo las "ciencias interiores" (como se les llama comúnmente) las cuales fueron compartidas entre las diferentes religiones. Debido a que sus instituciones monásticas de aprendizaje superior fueron las más numerosas, las ciencias interiores budistas se desarrollaron más

ampliamente. Es así que podemos tomar un análisis budista sobre la meditación y la mente contemplativa y usarlo como un ejemplo típico para nuestra discusión general.

La palabra *Meditación* proviene de las palabras del Sánscrito *dhyana, bhavana*, e incluso *samadhi*, las cuales designan organizaciones del conjunto cuerpo-mente, el cual se considera diferente a los estados receptivos sensorial e intelectual (como en el aprendizaje) y a los estados intelectual reflexivo o discursivo, aunque incluyen estos estados a veces. Se dice usualmente que hay dos categorías principales de meditación: *samatha* (tranquilizar) y *vipashyana* (ver a través, entender, o transformar), ambas con divisiones de tipo crítico y creativo.

Las meditaciones tranquilizantes son profundos estados de concentración, que culminan en un trance enfocado en un punto en específico, normalmente desprovisto de toda sensación de conciencia o flujo mental, aunque también capaz de contemplar con gran estabilidad una imagen fija o incluso un ambiente completo. Estas meditaciones producen marcados efectos físicos y proveen a la mente de salud y de la facilidad para ejecutar cualquier tarea que se proponga. Cuando nuestros investigadores de la salud estudian y prestan atención a los efectos de la meditación, casi siempre se refieren a la meditación libre de pensamientos, enfocada y tranquilizante, con o sin imágenes. La tranquilidad beneficia a la salud y da poder a la mente pero por sí solo no parece producir una transformación evolutiva, ni positiva ni negativa, en la persona.

Las meditaciones de transformación también son numerosas. Van desde las meditaciones básicas de atención plena con escaneo corporal, pasando por las meditaciones críticas de comprensión profunda, hasta las meditaciones imaginarias de visualización creativa. Son consideradas de gran importancia en el desarrollo espiritual, intelectual y psicológico. Han sido estudiadas relativamente poco, pero generalmente se consideran estrechamente relacionadas a los estados reflexivos.

En todas las culturas existen ambos tipos de mente contemplativa, incluso en las más sencillas: por naturaleza, los cazadores y las madres cultivaban los estados mentales enfocados en un punto en específico, y el creador, el chamán o la chamán, y el poeta o poetisa, los estados mentales más transformativos. Creo que es errado decir que nuestra cultura no utiliza la mente contemplativa. Cuando hacemos esa aseveración, nos referimos

más bien a los deplorables estados contemplativos dentro de los cuales la mente común es absorbida. Nuestras mentes están absortas en un ensueño continuo casi constante, y cuando dormimos, experimentamos un síndrome de abstinencia de estimulación sensorial. La educación, en cualquier cultura, construye una visión del mundo, constantemente reforzada por símbolos e imágenes que se contemplan durante toda la vida. La televisión, el peculiar templo contemplativo de la cultura moderna, suministra un trance contemplativo a millones de personas, por horas enteras, día tras día, año tras año. Es, desafortunadamente, un trance en el cual se refuerza constantemente la insatisfacción sensorial; el enojo y la violencia son grabados en la mente, y se construye y mantiene la confusión y la falsa ilusión del materialismo.

De ese modo, cuando hablamos de buscar incrementar e intensificar la mente contemplativa en nuestra cultura, estamos, de hecho, hablando sobre métodos para transferir energías contemplativas de un enfoque a otro. Nos gustaría que la gente desarrollara estados contemplativos que incrementen la satisfacción, el desapego, la imparcialidad, la tolerancia, la paciencia, la no violencia y la compasión, los cuales disminuyen simultáneamente los sentimientos de enojo, irritación y paranoia. Nos gustaría que desarrollaran más sabiduría, más libertad y más capacidad para la responsabilidad y la creatividad al ser conscientes de las falsas realidades en las cuales nos ha enredado nuestra cultura materialista. Es importante que reconozcamos las opciones de valor implícita en la contemplación. Sólo haciendo esto podremos entender la oposición con la que nos encontramos, y que se derivan de otras opciones de valor.

Los intereses comerciales, con su industria de publicidad, no desean que disminuya nuestra avaricia y desarrollemos satisfacción. Los intereses militares en sus formas económicas, políticas, étnicas o nacionalistas no quieren que desarrollemos más tolerancia, pasividad y compasión. Y en general los grupos en el poder, en cualquier lugar del escalafón, no quieren que los gobernados se vuelvan muy perceptivos, muy independientes, muy creativos por sí mismos; se corre el riesgo de que se vuelvan desobedientes, rebeldes y no productivos en sus tareas asignadas. Es por eso que en Asia las instituciones contemplativas a veces recibían sus licencias del gobierno si creaban una segunda sociedad (de manera ritual fuera de la sociedad ordinaria) en donde la contemplación positiva fuera

fomentada, y si prometía tácitamente no interferir demasiado con la contemplación actual que la cultura dominante tiene por voluntad propia. En la comunidad fuera de la sociedad mundana (sanghai), la tranquilidad y la reflexión podrían ser valorados incluso por la élite gobernante, como una válvula de seguridad para individuos insociables.

El hecho es que desarrollar la capacidad contemplativa, ya sea tranquilizándose o viendo las cosas con más claridad, le da gran poder al individuo; la combinación de ambas aun más. Las civilizaciones que reprimieron estas capacidades tenían razones para arrebatar este poder a los individuos: solían formar colectivos y persistían en controlar inflexivamente a su gente debido a que estos individuos se sentían inseguros a causa de sus alrededores y sus vecinos; por consiguiente, estas civilizaciones mantenían un ejército substancioso.

Aunque a nosotros, los Euro-Americanos nos gusta pensar que somos principalmente individualistas (aunque al mismo tiempo pensamos que demasiado individualismo es algo malo), las sociedades occidentales han tendido a suprimir el individualismo por milenios (Al final, a Sócrates se le dio el cóctel de cicuta precisamente por corromper a los soldados potenciales con pensamiento crítico, además de que Esparta era el modelo dominante, no Atenas.) Por lo tanto, la orientación contemplativa humanística y humanitaria que nos gustaría desarrollar ha sido sistemáticamente reprimida durante todo este tiempo.

Entonces, no nos debe sorprender si las influencias comerciales o militares y los grupos gobernantes conservadores aún activos en nuestra sociedad se oponen a cualquier movimiento contemplativo incluso en la actualidad. Por el lado positivo, si la educación humanista tan esencial para la sociedad democrática moderna en verdad desea investir de poder a los individuos quienes continuamente deben recrear la democracia, necesita incorporar dimensiones contemplativas en su plan de estudios. Para que la educación humanista cumpla con su responsabilidad, la enseñanza de habilidades contemplativas debe ser una necesidad, no un lujo.

Nuestra sociedad se encuentra en una etapa complicada y malinterpretada, la llamada era post industrial y post moderna. Las democracias son en teoría meritocráticas y por lo tanto están obligadas en principio a tratar de proveer a cada individuo con las

oportunidades y las habilidades de gobernar el todo. Los individuos tienen la responsabilidad de tomar decisiones cruciales y tienen el poder tecnológico para causar una destrucción inmensa si toman decisiones ingenuas, con enojo o con codicia. Es el tipo de situaciones entre las cuales oscilamos, entre un pesimismo fatalista sobre nuestra posibilidad de sobrevivencia como especie y una visión optimista de cómo nuestra sociedad podría evolucionar a través de un mayor uso de prácticas contemplativas. Yo prefiero este último punto de vista (aunque no hago caso omiso a los peligros de las consecuencias negativas) y estoy plenamente consiente de que aquellos que piensan que el futuro no tiene remedio no apoyarán (es mas, se opondrán activamente) cualquier intento de crear una conciencia más contemplativa. Personalmente considero necesario para nuestra sobrevivencia el desarrollo de la comprensión contemplativa en cada individuo.

Hay muchas maneras de hacer a nuestra sociedad más contemplativa: James Joyce escribió *Estela de Finnegan* para hacer una impensable integración de palabras difícil de mantener; Maharishi Mahesh Yogi de meditación trascendental ha intentado organizar equipos contemplativos de operaciones especiales para viajar a zonas de conflicto y enviar ondas de meditación en masa para calmar a los grupos atrapados en las flamas de la furia y la violencia; La contemplación se imparte en prósperos centros establecidos en el oriente y en varios monasterios occidentales tales como los cisterciences, los trappenses y los benedictinos; hasta hace poco se ha comenzado a impartir más ampliamente en nuestras instituciones educativas.

He escogido la universidad de humanidades y ciencias como la única institución desligada vestigio de nuestras comunidades contemplativas extrasociales occidentales. Sin embargo, la universidad ha sido muy cooptada para otorgar capacidades y entrenar a individuos que están destinados a servir como la élite gobernante de las sociedades modernas y materialistas. Veo a los medios tecnológicos diversificándose, aunque torpemente, desde este complejo universitario para envolver a la sociedad más grande dentro de ella. Por lo tanto, si nuestra preocupación es sanar, iluminar y darles el poder a los individuos para vivir mejor y crear una sociedad más humana aprendiendo a manejar sus propias energías contemplativas, la comunidad académica debe convertirse en una arena vital dentro de la cual se pueda establecer un futuro más positivo.

II. ¿Cuál es el enfoque budista con respecto a la contemplación y la meditación? ¿Cómo fue usado en las civilizaciones budistas? ¿Cuál es su relevancia en nuestras sociedades modernas?

La esencia de la visión de la vida iluminada de Buda radica en su propósito evolutivo: los seres por naturaleza buscan la felicidad y pueden evolucionar eficazmente hacia una condición de felicidad perfecta a través del despertar a la realidad del mundo. La causa del sufrimiento es la ignorancia, un errado entendimiento de la irrealidad como si fuera la realidad. El antídoto al entendimiento errado es la iluminación, la cual lleva al súper entendimiento, la comprensión, o la sabiduría. La forma de vida humana ya se encuentra evolucionando hacia la iluminación. El cometido ideal de la vida humana, por lo tanto, son las disciplinas y las prácticas que mejoren y aceleren la evolución hacia la iluminación. Debido a que la sabiduría es la causa final de la iluminación, de la liberación de la ignorancia, se puede afirmar que estas disciplinas y prácticas son educativas en el sentido clásico. Una persona no puede iluminar a otra. Ningún dios puede iluminar a alguien. Ninguna creencia puede iluminar a alguien. Ninguna meditación puede iluminar a alguien. Los entendimientos trasformativos de un individuo son la causa de la iluminación. Las creencias realistas, otras personas hábiles y útiles, las meditaciones y las prácticas pueden ayudar durante el proceso de educación pero lo que libera la comprensión realista son los logros y procesos del propio individuo.

Es por esto que las civilizaciones budistas desarrollaron instituciones y planes de estudios que invistieran de poder a los individuos. La India se convirtió en la civilización más individualista de todas después de la era de Buda. La India budista fue la primera en desarrollar el monacato cenobítico, y ese monacato evolucionó en una red de universidades con un plan de estudios liberador. El plan de estudios budista siempre cultivaba la mente contemplativa para investir poder y para la trasformación liberadora.

La tradición budista, por lo tanto, debe verse esencialmente como una tradición educativa. En su esencia y sus inicios, no es muy *religiosa* en el sentido usual de esa palabra, es decir, enfocada en lo trascendental, lo sagrado, en las realidades supremas, y

garantías de significado, ya que sus metas son más bien liberales y evolutivas. Buda rompió con el sistema religioso dominante de su mundo, la poderosa atmósfera de los Brahmanes Vedas; la encontró engañosa, no liberadora, y no necesariamente evolutiva en una dirección positiva. Sumergía erróneamente al individuo en la colectividad, reforzando el sentido de deber social en varios niveles con supremas y sagradas sanciones. Se apoyaban en la existencia de deidades; Buda no cuestionó la existencia de los dioses pero no creía que sus poderes fueran como los Brahmines creían. Creía que estas deidades tenían poderes mundanos pero no el poder para liberar a los individuos del sufrimiento, o incluso a sí mismos de sus devastadoras agonías. Además de que los Vedas disfrutaban de los rituales de sacrificio que causan sufrimiento y muerte a muchos animales, esto llevaba a la evolución en una dirección negativa en vez de una positiva. Buda rechazó todo esto y expuso lo siguiente: (1) Los individuos deben hacerse cargo de su propio destino evolutivo, sin depender de deidades o alguien más. (2) Los individuos tienen que enfrentar el hecho de que toda vida atada a falsas ilusiones es inevitablemente frustrante y a la larga miserable, y por lo tanto se debe buscar vencer la falsa ilusión cultivando sabiduría y (3) debido a que la evolución positiva no tiene límites, los individuos pueden participar en la creación de un mundo de felicidad para todos en vez de un mundo no iluminado con sufrimiento universal.

Me gustaría enfatizar que en el budismo y, por consiguiente, en el pensamiento indio en general, las falsas ilusiones son la raíz del sufrimiento, y la sabiduría es el antídoto a las falsas ilusiones, por lo tanto esta es la fuente de la liberación. La sabiduría (*prajna*) no es conocimiento instrumental acumulado, sino que es un tipo especial de súper entendimiento, un conocimiento que se da al transformarse en lo conocido, al trascender la dicotomía sujeto-objeto. Por lo tanto, la liberación se alcanza no creyendo, no participando en ninguna ceremonia o perteneciendo a algún grupo, sino entendiendo en la manera más profunda posible. El cultivo de tal entendimiento naturalmente se convirtió en la tarea de las enseñanzas de Buda y en la misión de la tradición budista. La contemplación fue una disciplina indispensable para profundizar y para darle poder a este entendimiento.

Se consideraba que el camino hacia la libertad tenía ocho ramas, ocho canales de realismo que gradualmente vencen la masiva irrealidad generada por la falsa ilusión instintiva. Estas ocho ramas son llamadas la visión perfecta, la emoción perfecta, el habla

perfecta, la acción perfecta, subsistencia perfecta, el esfuerzo perfecto, la atención perfecta y el *samadi* perfecto. A su vez esas ocho están agrupados en las Tres Espirituales o Educaciones Superiores (*adhishiksha*): Las educaciones superiores de justicia o moralidad, meditación y sabiduría. Buda descubrió que era incapaz de liberar a la gente con tan sólo la fuerza de su sabiduría o compasión. Sólo podía ayudarles a abrir sus mentes hacia un nuevo entendimiento del yo y el mundo; por lo tanto se vio forzado a canalizar toda su sabiduría y compasión en la educación. Es por eso que la tradición budista siempre ha estado enfocada en la educación espiritual. El monasterio budista no era fundamentalmente un lugar de soledad, sino que era un lugar de cultivo. La sabiduría, el motor de la liberación, era cultivada en tres niveles, a través del aprendizaje, la reflexión crítica y la penetración contemplativa. Primero, uno aprendía el Dharma y se apartaba de la mente ingenua propia para adentrarse en la mente Buda al involucrarse con el discurso iluminado registrado en los Sutras y sus explicaciones. Una vez entendidas las enseñanzas a un nivel superficial, uno tiene que enfrentar su mente instintivamente ingenua contra el nuevo, deducible, y relativamente delicado entendimiento del Dharma verbal, y forcejear internamente, cultivando profundas dudas a través de de la reflexión critica para encontrar el significado más profundo. Cuando este proceso se lleva a cabo con gran energía y determinación, la reflexión crítica se transforma en concentración penetrativa sobre el entendimiento cultivado y profundizado con duda. Esta concentración aleja energía del entendimiento errado instintivo y la vierte en el entendimiento liberal de sabiduría trascendental hasta que el entendimiento realista se transforma en intuitivo e instintivo. La sabiduría se vuelve intuitiva, el entendimiento propio es altruista, y la persona disfruta de la liberación; todo ocurre al mismo tiempo.

Este tipo de plan de estudios principal fue mantenido por más de 10 siglos en cientos de universidades budistas monásticas a través de la India. Muchas más se desarrollaron en gran parte de los países asiáticos desde Sri Lanka hasta Japón. La fértil situación económica de la India, la especial mansedumbre de su cortés cultura antigua, y su tolerancia a la liberación individual difícilmente fueron duplicados en otros países donde las condiciones eran más duras. Después de que la civilización clásica india fuera totalmente destrozada por las invasiones musulmanas al final del primer milenio después de

Cristo, este plan de estudios fue preservado con mayor fidelidad e implementado en el refugio de las altas montañas del Tíbet, a donde muchos de los grandes maestros indios huyeron. Y es así que fragmentos del programa educativo del movimiento budista global apenas han comenzado a emerger completamente desde la apertura del Tíbet.

III. ¿Qué estamos haciendo para proveer educación humanista en los institutos y universidades de letras y humanidades? ¿Se puede fomentar desarrollando una orientación más contemplativa por parte de la academia y los estudiantes?

Dentro de nuestras instituciones de educación superior, intentamos liberar el intelecto crítico, la estabilidad emocional, la sensibilidad estética y la decencia moral. Teóricamente, las ciencias naturales desarrollan inteligencia y conocimiento de la realidad, las ciencias sociales desarrollan conciencia de las dimensiones sociales, y las humanidades proveen estabilidad emocional y sensibilidad estética y moldean un sentido de decencia moral. Originalmente se separó a la religión de las humanidades (su contenido se dividió entre literatura, historia, filología, y filosofía) por que el estudio científico de la religión no podía proceder efectivamente mientras que estuviera dominado por una sola religión. Esta tradición nació del Renacimiento a través del impulso que la "Ilustración" tuvo en el despertar de todo el poder humano. La nueva noción en que el propósito de la vida humana era ir más allá de la adoración de una realidad trascendental (concebida como un misterioso dios todopoderoso) hacia el entendimiento de la realidad, asumiendo responsabilidad por si mismo y el ambiente; el concepto existencial completo. Entonces, es natural que la religión sea vista con sospecha por la academia. Sin embargo, sin la ayuda de las disciplinas contemplativas e intelectuales más profundas de la religión a las humanidades y las ciencias se les impide transformarse con eficacia en artes y ciencias *liberadoras*. La gente es informada y certificada pero no preparada apropiadamente para ejercer las responsabilidades que el humanismo impone en el individuo. No es que la religión pueda hacer esta contribución debido a la eficacia de una creencia u otra, o de una práctica u otra (incluyendo la práctica de la meditación); las religiones se ocupan de la orientación

suprema del humano, con sus metas supremas, y por lo tanto poseen un amplio repertorio de artes y disciplinas, permitiendo a los individuos integrar su ser completo (sus elementos físicos, éticos, emocionales, intelectuales y espirituales). Aunque ninguna religión en particular podría o debería dominar la academia de nuevo, las disciplinas morales, psicológicas, contemplativas y filosóficas arraigadas dentro de las varias religiones deben hacerse disponibles para los profesores y estudiantes si la educación pretende ir más allá de ser simplemente informativa y volverse transformativa.

Afortunadamente, el *estudio de la religión* en los departamentos de estudios religiosos ha regresado a las universidades humanísticas, aunque labora bajo la mirada inquisidora de los científicos (naturales y sociales) y otros eruditos humanistas muy consientes de la prevaleciente canonización de la secularidad. No obstante, los departamentos de religión son capaces de restaurar en el plan de estudios los recursos de las mayores tradiciones espirituales del mundo para autoexploración, autoeducación, autoliberación y auto integración. Sin embargo, esto debe ser llevado a cabo de una manera impecable, no sólo debido a que lo rodea la sospecha sino también para asegurar el pluralismo. Ninguna religión puede volverse imperante de nuevo, que sus recursos sean los dominantes o su enfoque controle a otros, por lo cual un departamento de religión moderno debe incorporar cursos de todas las tradiciones más importantes.

En este contexto, podemos abordar con mayor claridad el tema de la contemplación dentro de las universidades. Hemos visto que la contemplación encaja en el plan de estudios tradicional de las ciencias internas en el nivel más alto gracias a la cultivación de la sabiduría. Por lo tanto, la contemplación es prácticamente indispensable si la sabiduría se va a volver completamente transformativa. Para las instituciones académicas la cuestión es, entonces, que no se trata sobre si se agrega o no un atractivo extra a su vasta diversidad de ofertas. Más bien, se trata de que cumplan con eficacia su deber de proporcionar una educación humanista (es decir, liberadora y que invista poder). El proceso pedagógico ideal es primero aprender algo realmente bien, usando memorización y estudio extenso; después reflexionar sobre ello internamente, ayudado por el debate o discusión enérgica con los maestros u otros estudiantes; y finalmente meditar sobre los primeras

interpretaciones de una manera enfocada y sostenida para así desarrollar el entendimiento a una profundidad transformativa.

IV.   ¿Cuáles programas de estudio ayudarían a lograr que las prácticas contemplativas formaran parte habitual de una educación en humanidades?

Debemos reconocer que ya proveemos oportunidades contemplativas a nuestros estudiantes fuera del campus, ya que proporcionamos oportunidades para estudiar en el extranjero en países tales como la India, Tailandia, Tíbet, Nepal y Sri Lanka. También estamos concientes, aunque institucionalmente es inquietante, que nuestros estudiantes se unen a centros de meditación y van a retiros ofrecidos por todas las religiones (aunque asisten principalmente a las que tienen base occidental y que se han vuelto especialmente populares en este país.) También hay grupos de estudiantes en el campus, frecuentemente fundamentalistas, que ofrecen oportunidades de participación en sus rituales, sesiones de cánticos, reuniones para orar y actividades confesionales de varios tipos.

Finalmente, y basado en el modelo terapéutico o atlético, hay clínicas de reducción de estrés y clases de yoga y Tai Chi en nuestro departamento de educación física. El punto en citar otra vez estas actividades que se están llevando a cabo es el de recordar que antes de considerar otros métodos, debemos reforzar esas actividades que ya están rindiendo un servicio valioso.

Otras estrategias que podrían desarrollarse son las siguientes: (1) Fomentar el establecimiento de centros contemplativos en los campus tales como el propuesto en la Universidad Middlebury por Steven Rockefeller. El Centro para el estudio de las religiones del mundo de la Universidad de Harvard se erigió gracias a sus donadores con tal propósito en mente, aunque importante mencionar, su cuarto de meditación fue eventualmente convertido en una biblioteca. La capilla de la Universidad Colgate fue fundada por los mismos donadores y ha proporcionado un poco de alivio contemplativo en su centro para estudiantes de licenciatura a lo largo de los años. Sé por experiencia propia que la Universidad Amherst, la Universidad Williams, la Universidad Wesleyan, la Universidad Hampshire, la Universidad Mount Holyoke y la Universidad Smith cuentan con capillas

que pueden crecer, volverse pluralizadas y contemplativas dependiendo de la disposición del profesorado que esté motivado y dispuesto a proporcionar liderazgo. En la Universidad de Columbia ciertamente, la capilla de San Pablo y la residencia universitaria Earl son usadas por varios grupos diferentes para diversos tipos de prácticas contemplativas. Estoy casi seguro de que cada universidad o institución de humanidades tiene recursos disponibles que pueden utilizarse para apoyar tales prácticas. (2) Alentar a que los departamentos consideren la experiencia y habilidad contemplativa en alguna tradición religiosa como un logro reconocido y recompensado para profesor y el estudiante. Del mismo modo en que el saber sobre un texto, un ritual, una doctrina, una era histórica, una institución u individuo en particular expresado en una tesis u otra demostración es evaluado y recompensado, así también debería ser evaluado y recompensado el conocimiento de una práctica de meditación en particular, adquirido a través del estudio de textos, exploración de instituciones y experiencia personal de la práctica, expresada en una tesis u otra demostración. (3) Exhortar a los investigadores de las ciencias sociales y naturales a expander sus investigaciones hacia los efectos fisiológicos de las varias disciplinas meditativas. El profesor Davidson en la Universidad de Wisconsin ha usado imágenes de resonancia magnética para demostrar ciertas capacidades mentales bien desarrolladas manifestadas en monjes experimentados en la meditación. (4) Incitar a los especialistas en estudios religiosos a que realicen investigación, traduzcan, y publiquen más literatura contemplativa, técnica y/o evocadora, nacida de las disciplinas contemplativas. Como a menudo destaco, en el ámbito del desarrollo contemplativo, no debemos cometer el error de invertir mucho en las posibilidades de *hardware* y así relegar el extraordinario *software* desarrollado durante milenios por las culturas y tradiciones contemplativas. (5) Fomentar producciones en los medios de comunicación que instruyan e informen sobre la práctica contemplativa, llegando de ese modo a una amplia audiencia, desmitificando la contemplación, y creando una mayor aceptación pública de la contemplación en el campo educativo.

Hay múltiples oportunidades para trabajar creativamente en la integración de las prácticas contemplativas en la educación superior, agradecidos con el Centro para la Mente Contemplativa en la Sociedad el apoyo que ha dado a los miembros de la academia en

instituciones y universidades a través del país para involucrarse en este desafiante trabajo. Auguramos que su trabajo se incrementará en años próximos cuando nuestra sociedad se vuelva más conciente de la gran necesidad de tales prácticas.

ROBERT THURMAN es profesor Jey Tsong Khapa de estudios budistas Indo-Tibetanos en la Universidad de Columbia, y también ejerce el cargo de presidente de la Casa Tíbet. Como antiguo monje budista estrechamente relacionado con el Dalai Lama, ha tenido un papel decisivo en la traducción del budismo para el público occidental. Entre sus muchas publicaciones se encuentran *The Smile of the Buddha; Anger; The Central Philosophy of Tibet;* y el recientemente publicado *The Jewel Tree of Tibet.*

SOURCE TEXT

The Contemplative Life and the Teaching of the Humanities

BRIAN STOCK

University of Toronto

Meditation nowadays plays a part in mind/body medicine and in some branches of educational psychology. In ancient and medieval times, these functions formed a part of the humanities curriculum as it was taught in philosophical schools, monastic communities, and universities. This article claims that it is by returning to a holistic view of the functions of the humanities by means of meditative disciplines that the value and usefulness of the humanities can be most successfully integrated into Western life and institutions. In bringing about this perspective, teachers in the humanities have a great deal to learn from research in the cognitive neurosciences.

In recent years, meditation has been enjoying a considerable vogue in medicine and psychology. There has also been a growth of interest in religion, which has taken the shape of reviving dormant meditative traditions (e.g., Roman Catholicism) or importing foreign ones (e.g., Buddhist practice into Judaism). Native, feminist, and ecological thinking has contributed to this renaissance. As a result, a good many people have been attracted to the idea of contemplative activity for the first time.

To date, the humanities have played a relatively minor role in this discourse despite the obvious fact that a humanities discipline, religion, is the source of all that we know about traditional meditative practices. In my view, this situation is unlikely to change in the short term. As the philosopher Edmund Husserl (1965) has put it, The "theoretical interest" of the humanities should ideally be "directed to human beings as persons, to their personal life and activity" and to "the concrete results of this activity" (p. 150). In practice, however, teachers of the humanities deal almost exclusively with the analysis of texts (or with source materials that can be discussed by means of literary theory). Opinions have changed radically over the years on what is the best interpretive procedure. But no major branch of contemporary thinking in the humanities is meditative in its aims or style.

Husserl was persuaded that the disciplines dealing with culture had by his time entered a profound state of crisis. Many teachers of the humanities in contemporary schools and universities would agree, while acknowledging

that the issues have undergone considerable change since 1935, when his celebrated critique was written. Husserl was one of a handful of 20th-century philosophers whose unified view of the humanities made a significant place for contemplative activity within a secular worldview. As the study of the humanities has become increasingly fragmented, there has been an ever-growing chorus of voices calling for a comprehensive vision of some kind. What the critics are asking for, among other things, is a type of education that teaches the student how "to live as a person . . . in a social framework, wherein I and we live together in community and have the community as a horizon": They want the humanities to focus on "purposeful living, manifesting spiritual creativity in the broadest sense, creating culture within historical continuity" (Husserl, 1965, p. 150).

The roots of this approach, which insists that education deal with the whole person, lie in ancient thought. It used to be fashionable to think of ancient Greek philosophy chiefly as a preface to modern logic and scientific method. Scholars nowadays recognize that it was also concerned with a wide range of contemplative issues, which included the creation of self-knowledge through intellectual or spiritual exercises. This interpretation is particularly accurate for the later ancient period, when Greek philosophy was enriched by Judeo-Christian themes. Linked to oral instruction—that is, to direct interchange between a master and students—this type of reflection achieved its aims through the consistency of its arguments and through its ability to address the moral and ethical needs of a community. The exercises by which individuals were prepared for this challenge were not arid and abstract, although they were intensely cognitive: They were intended to develop the intellect, and through this to transform a life.

There is little formal meditation in ancient thought. Nor is there much talk about it in the Old Testament or the New Testament. Meditative practice really came into its own in the later ancient and medieval periods, reaching its high point of development before the 12th century; it owes a great deal to the original thinking of the desert fathers and monastic authors. Plotinus, the last great pagan thinker (d. 270 A.D.), gave a prominent place to contemplative ascent within a neoplatonist scheme. His ideas were taken over by Augustine in an attempt to unite prayerful reading and contemplative activity; these methods in turn eventually influenced both Catholic and Protestant devotional practices. The typically Western format, which was consolidated by the fourth century, incorporated meditative practice into the study of scripture, effectively making meditation part of a reading project, although remaining distinct within it. In the background of this epochal change were the study habits of Jewish Christianity and ultimately of Judaism itself.

It is frequently proposed that the breakdown of this approach to spiritual education occurred during the Reformation or the Scientific Revolution. In

reality, the decisive changes occurred during the 12th and 13th centuries, when the first European universities emerged from monastic and cathedral schools and undertook to complete a largely Aristotelian program in logic, the natural sciences, and theology. Well before Galileo and Newton challenged medieval scientific methods, serious students of the contemplative life had abandoned the universities of Bologna, Paris, Oxford, and Cambridge and sought refuge in a variety of institutions more congenial to their activities, mainly religious houses. Virtually none of the "mystics" of the early modern period—men and women who led contemplative lives between the time of Meister Eckhart and Teresa of Avila—worked within what was taking shape as the modern humanities. The modern humanities, from the time of Petrarch, were increasingly dominated by the "humanist" concern with correctness of Greek and Latin and with the rehabilitation of a skeptical, textually oriented interpretive tradition in figures like Lorenzo Valla, Erasmus, and Scaliger. The appearance of the printed book in a standardized format completed this transformation, in part by favoring visual, silent reading over oral, meditative reading practices. By the time of the Reformation, contemplatives, instead of withdrawing completely from society as they frequently did during the Middle Ages, sought occasions for contemplation within active lives. That is the typically modern situation.

When we talk about reintroducing the contemplative life into the humanities, therefore, we have to give some thought to what we are up against. Humanities methods have been extraordinarily stable over something like five centuries; all attempts to introduce alternatives have been successfully rebuffed. Periodic revivals of religious studies have not been able to dislodge entrenched ideas either, so a confrontational attitude would not be successful, even if it were advisable. Moreover, what one wants, ideally, is not an increased academic interest in meditation—we already have that in specialist circles—but the reestablishment of a tradition in which, along the model of some Eastern cultures, meditative practices and other intellectual activities are mutually supportive: a situation in which the person who meditates is not stepping out of the mainstream of his or her society, but is engaging in something normal and unremarkable, like keeping fit.

I think that the best way to achieve this goal is to begin with a concept related to the person's overall health. Let us call this the individual's well-being. Many Americans have little understanding of what is meant by meditation, but they all understand sickness, discomfort, and healing. If they are persuaded that meditation will contribute to their health, they may accept the idea of pursuing a contemplative activity within their daily lives. Some students of meditative practices will complain that I am tackling a spiritual problem through physical means, but the two cannot be separated. If people are taught to meditate, sooner or later many of them will discover

the spiritual dimension on their own. In traditional settings, the pursuit of the contemplative life normally takes place within an accompanying belief system. The only equivalent of this type of faith in contemporary society may be the confidence displayed in science. If I ask a room full of Americans to meditate for cultural, religious, or spiritual reasons, I am likely to find myself in the midst of a heated debate about their emotional and intellectual loyalties. If I suggest that meditation may help them achieve better health, and ultimately, perhaps, a state of well-being, most of them would weigh the evidence before dismissing my arguments.

That evidence is slowly being assembled. Yet, the study of meditative practice cannot afford to stand still in this respect. The notion of teachings of "timeless wisdom" is somewhat misleading. We lack a sufficiently large and diversified body of experimental evidence proving that large-scale programs in meditation would deliver the benefits that they promise, despite encouraging recent progress in major medical institutions. We know that stress reduction techniques like meditation lead to a positive state of the parasympathetic nervous system, and meditation is used increasingly to help prevent and treat heart disease, autoimmune disorders, chronic lung disease, headaches, diabetes, eczema, asthma, allergies, infertility, and gastrointestinal problems, as well as panic, depression, and hostility. But more studies are needed to clarify the effect of meditation in relation to other mind/body therapies.

If we move from the clinical to the cultural aspects of the question, the difficulties increase. It may be easy to measure the effect of sustained meditation on blood pressure, cardiovascular disease, and stress reduction as contrasted with trying to determine its influence on nebulous issues like the sense of self and other, or the willingness to participate in family, community, and collaborative work. We do not know whether concentrated inwardness can fortify the individual against the commercial exploitation of the sensorium by the media; we have yet to determine its effect on individuals' predilection for aggression, violence, socially deviant behavior, and the destruction of the environment. We have not come to grips with still more subtle relations involving trust, patience, generosity, confidence, and love. If some sort of scientific information is not built up on these and related issues, I do not believe that meditation will have a lasting role in American life and thought.

At the end of this long road lies what we mean by a humanities education for young adults in American society. If contemplative activity contributes to their sense of well-being and if it helps to put them in a frame of mind that enhances their ability to cope with a range of issues ranging from health to their sense of community, then presumably contemplative traditions should have a larger place in educational programs. And, if that is the case, we have to teach students what contemplative activity is all about. Among other

things, they have to be instructed in reading meditative literature, not as they would read modern poems, plays, or novels, but as contemplatives read them, using texts as a means to an end and not considering them, as is the fashion in contemporary literary practice, as ends in themselves. They would also have to explore types of meditation that are unlike the Judeo-Christian tradition in not requiring the presence of texts, images, or other sensory supports. Beyond that, teachers of the humanities would have to use the renewed interest in the contemplative life to begin an exploration of what we mean by "the modern identity"—that is, as a means of "tracing the various strands of what it means to be a human agent, a person, or a self" (Taylor, 1989, p. 3). This implies broadening the discussion of ethics beyond the traditionally narrow confines of academic speculation and taking up a number of cultural connections such as religious history, gender orientation, and ecological considerations. Much contemporary moral philosophy, Charles Taylor (1989) noted, "has tended to focus on what it is right to do rather on what it is good to be, on defining the content of obligation rather than the nature of the good life; and it has no conceptual place left for a notion of the good as the object of our love or allegiance" (p. 3). Within the humanities, that is a major challenge.

References

Husserl E. (1965). *Phenomenology and the crisis of philosophy*, trans. Q. Lauer. New York: Harper and Row.

Taylor C. (1989). *Sources of the self: the making of the modern identity.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

BRIAN STOCK teaches history and literature in the Department of English at the University of Toronto. He has written a number of studies that deal with modes of perception between the classical and the early modern period. These include *The Implications of Literacy* (1981), a study of the rise of literate understanding during the Middle Ages, and *Augustine, the Reader* (1996), which discusses the relationship between reading, meditation, and the ethics of interpretation in the late ancient period. In 1999, he delivered the Rosenbach Lectures at the University of Pennsylvania on reading, meditation, and the history of mind/body medicine. He held the *Chaire Internationale* at the Collège de France in 1999–2000, and in 2001 was Sather Professor of Classical Literature at the University of California, Berkeley.

Meditation and Education: India, Tibet, and Modern America

ROBERT A. F. THURMAN

Columbia University

This article explores Asian traditions of meditation, with particular attention to Buddhism as it was developed in ancient India. It delineates a core curriculum, initially developed in monastic institutions of higher education, that has been most fully preserved in Tibet. It then explores how this curriculum might be adapted so that it can help support a genuinely humanistic education within American higher education. This exploration focuses not only on the inherent values of Buddhist meditation but also on practical strategies that can be used to introduce these values in the academic curriculum and in the broader campus life.

I. WHAT IS "MEDITATION"? WHAT IS "CONTEMPLATIVE MIND"? WHEN WE FEEL WE'VE LOST IT, NEED MORE OF IT, CAN IMPROVE OUR HEALTH WITH IT, CAN GENERATE WELL-BEING WITH IT, WHAT IS THIS "IT"? HOW DID IT GET LOST IN THE WEST AND THE MODERN WORLD? WHO HAS BEEN FOR IT, WHO AGAINST IT?

It is fair to say that classical Indian civilization incorporated the contemplative far more than any other, then or now. The contemplative marked that civilization in every way. It caused it to develop unparalleled "inner sciences," as they are often called, which were shared among the various religions. The Buddhist inner sciences were the most broadly developed because their monastic institutions of higher learning were the most numerous. So we can conveniently use a Buddhist analysis of meditation and contemplative mind as typical for our general discussion.

Meditation translates from the Sanskrit *dhyana*, *bhavana*, and even *samadhi*, which all designate organizations of the mind-body complex considered different from sensory and intellectual receptive states (as in learning) and intellectual reflective or discursive states, though they include these states sometimes. There are usually said to be two main categories of meditation: *shamatha* (calming) and *vipashyana* (seeing-through, insight, or transforming), with both again dividing into critical and creative types.

Calming meditations are deep concentration states, culminating in one-pointed trance, usually devoid of all sensory awareness or mental flow, though also able to entertain with great stability a fixed picture or even a full environment. They produce marked physical effects and equip the mind with fitness and fluency in executing whatever tasks it addresses. When our health researchers note and study effects of meditation, they are almost always referring to calming, one-pointed, thought-free meditation, with or without images. Calming benefits health and empowers the mind but by itself it is not thought to produce in a person either positive or negative evolutionary transformation.

Seeing-through or transforming meditations are also numerous. They range from basic scanning mindfulness meditations, through critically penetrating insight meditations, up to imaginatively creative visualizing meditations. They are considered most important in psychological, intellectual, and spiritual development. They have been studied relatively little but are generally viewed as closely related to reflective states.

Both these types of contemplative mind exist in all cultures, even the simplest: Naturally, hunters and mothers cultivated the most one-pointed mind-states, and the maker, the shaman/shamaness and the poet/poetess the most transformative. I think it can be quite misleading to speak of our culture as lacking contemplative mind. When we make that claim, we are rather lamenting the deplorable contemplative states within which the common mind is absorbed. Our minds are absorbed in continuous reverie almost all the time, and when we sleep, we experience a withdrawal from sensory stimuli. Education in any particular culture builds up a worldview, constantly reinforced by symbols and images that are contemplated throughout life. Television, modern culture's peculiar contemplative shrine, supplies a contemplative trance to millions of people, for hours on end, day after day, year in and year out. It is unfortunately a trance in which sensory dissatisfaction is constantly reinforced, anger and violence is imprinted, and confusion and the delusion of materialism is constructed and maintained.

Thus, when we talk about seeking to increase and intensify contemplative mind in our culture, we are actually talking about methods of transferring contemplative energies from one focus to another. We would like for people to develop contemplative states that increase contentment, detachment, tolerance, patience, nonviolence, and compassion, which simultaneously decrease feelings of anger, irritation, and paranoia. We would like them to develop more wisdom, more freedom, and more capacity for responsibility and creativity by seeing through the constructed realities in which our materialist culture has enmeshed us. It is important that we recognize the value choices implicit in our esteem for contemplation. Only by doing so can we understand the opposition that we are encountering, deriving from other value choices.

Commercial interests, with their advertising industry, do not want us to develop contentment and less greed. Military interests in economic, political, ethnic, or nationalist guises do not want us to develop more tolerance, nonviolence, and compassion. And ruling groups in general, in whatever sort of hierarchy, do not want the ruled to become too insightful, too independent, too creative on their own; the danger is that they will become insubordinate, rebellious, and unproductive in their allotted tasks. Therefore, in Asia, contemplative institutions at times received their licenses from the governments by creating a second society—ritually outside the ordinary society—wherein contemplation in the directions we consider positive was encouraged, and by tacitly promising not to interfere too much with the dominant culture's ongoing contemplation of its own necessity. In the community outside the mundane society (sanghai), calming and insight could be valued, even by the ruling elite, as a sort of safety valve activity for unsocializable individuals.

The fact is that developing contemplative capacity—either calming or seeing-through—greatly empowers an individual, the combination even more so. Civilizations that suppressed these capacities had reason for wishing to disempower individuals: They tended to be collectivistic and persistent in regimenting their people because of their insecurity with respect to the environment and their neighbors; hence, these civilizations maintained substantial armies.

Though we Euro-Americans like to think of ourselves as primarily individualistic (even when we simultaneously consider too much of that a bad thing), Western societies have tended to suppress individualism over the millennia. Socrates finally was given the hemlock cocktail for corrupting the potential soldiers with critical thought, and Sparta was the dominant model, not Athens. Therefore, the kind of humanistic and humanizing contemplative orientation we would like to develop has been systematically suppressed all along.

So we must not be surprised if commercial and military influences and conservative ruling groups still active in our society set themselves against any contemplative movement even today. On a more positive note, if the liberal education so essential to a modern democratic society really wants to empower the individuals who must constantly re-create democracy, it needs to incorporate contemplative dimensions in its curriculum. For liberal education to fulfill its responsibility, the teaching of contemplative skills is a necessity, not a luxury.

Our society has entered a quite complicated and ill-understood time, the so-called postindustrial and postmodern age. Democracies are meritocratic in ideal and so are compelled in principle to try to provide each individual with the opportunity and ability to rule the whole. Individuals have the responsibility to make crucial decisions and the technological power to

cause immense destruction if they make deluded, greedy, and angry choices. It is the kind of situation in which we oscillate between terminal, doomsday pessimism about our chances of surviving as a species at all and a utopian, optimistic vision about how our society might evolve through an increased use of contemplative practices. I prefer the latter kind of view (while not blinding myself to the dangers of negative outcomes) and remain fully aware that those who think the future hopeless will not support—indeed, will actively oppose—any attempt to create a more contemplative awareness. I personally consider broad-scale individual development of contemplative insight to be necessary for survival.

There are many ways to make our society more contemplative. James Joyce wrote *Finnegan's Wake* to make unthinking embeddedness in words more difficult to maintain. Maharishi Mahesh Yogi from transcendental meditation has tried to organize contemplative SWAT teams to travel to trouble spots to send out mass meditation waves to calm groups caught in the flames of fury and violence. Contemplation is taught in thriving Eastern-based centers and various Western monasteries such as Cistercian, Trappist, and Benedictine. In recent times, it has begun to be taught more widely in our educational institutions.

I have chosen the liberal arts and sciences university as the individually liberating institution left over from our Western extrasocial contemplative communities. It has, however, been too much coopted to empower and train individuals who are destined to serve as the ruling elite of materialist, modern societies. I view the technological media as branching out, however clumsily, from this university complex to enfold the larger society within it. Therefore, if our concern is to heal, enlighten, and empower individuals to live better and create a more humane society by learning how to manage their own contemplative energies, the academic community should become a vital arena within which a more positive future can be determined.

II. WHAT IS THE BUDDHIST APPROACH TO CONTEMPLATION AND MEDITATION? HOW WAS IT USED IN BUDDHIST CIVILIZATIONS? HOW CAN IT BE RELEVANT TO OUR MODERN SOCIETIES?

The essence of the Buddha's awakened vision of life is that its purpose is evolutionary: Beings naturally seek happiness and can effectively evolve into a condition of perfect happiness through awakening to the reality of the world. The cause of suffering is ignorance, an active misknowing of unreality as if it were reality. The antidote to misknowing is awakening, which leads to superknowing, insight, or wisdom. The human life form is already immensely evolved toward awakening, and the ideal occupation of a human lifetime, therefore, is disciplines and practices that enhance and accelerate evolution toward awakening. Because wisdom is the ultimate

cause of awakening, of liberation from ignorance, then these disciplines and practices are educational in the classical sense. One person cannot awaken another. No God can awaken someone. No belief can awaken someone. No meditation can awaken someone. The individual's transformative understanding is the cause of awakening. Realistic beliefs, helpful and skillful others, meditations and practices—all these can help by supporting the process of education. But the realistic understanding that liberates is the individual's own process and attainment.

Therefore, the Buddhist civilizations developed institutions and curricula that empowered individuals. India became the most individualistic of all civilizations after the time of Buddha. Buddhist India was the first to develop cenobitic monasticism, and that monasticism developed into a network of universities with a liberating curriculum. The Buddhist curriculum always cultivated contemplative mind, both for empowerment and for liberating transformation.

The Buddhist tradition should thus be viewed essentially as an educational tradition. In its essence and beginnings, it is not too *religious* in the usual sense of that word—that is, focused on the transcendent, the sacred, concerned with ultimate realities, warrants of meaning. Its goals are rather liberative and evolutionary. The Buddha broke with the dominant religious system of his world, the powerful religious atmosphere of the Vedic Brahmins. He found it misleading, not liberating, and not necessarily evolutionary in a positive direction. It wrongly submerged the individual in the collectivity, reinforcing the sense of social duty at various levels with ultimate sacred sanctions. It relied on deities; Buddha did not question their existence but thought their powers to be not as believed by the Brahmins. He thought that these deities had mundane powers but not the power to liberate individuals from suffering, or even themselves from their own devastating agonies. And the Vedas enjoined rituals of sacrifice that cause suffering and death to many animals, which turned evolution in a negative rather than a positive direction. The Buddha rejected all this, and set forth the following: (1) individuals have to take charge of their own evolutionary destiny, not relying on deities or any others; (2) individuals have to face the fact that all life bound by delusion is inevitably frustrating and ultimately miserable, and hence seek to overcome delusion by cultivating wisdom; and (3) because positive evolution has no limits, individuals can participate in creating a world of happiness for all instead of the unenlightened world of universal suffering.

I would like to emphasize that in Buddhist and, consequently, Indian thought in general, delusion is the root cause of suffering, and wisdom is the antidote for delusion and thus the root cause of liberation. Wisdom (*prajna*) is not accumulated instrumental knowledge, but is rather a special kind of superknowing, a knowing by becoming the known, by transcending

the subject-object dichotomy. Thus, liberation is achieved not by believing, not by participating in any ceremony or belonging to any group, but by understanding in the deepest possible way. The cultivation of such understanding naturally became the task of the Buddha's teaching and the mission of the Buddhist tradition. Contemplation was an indispensable discipline for deepening and empowering this understanding.

The path to freedom was viewed as having eight branches, eight channels of realism that can gradually overcome the massive unreality generated by instinctual delusion. These eight are called realistic worldview, realistic attitude, realistic speech, realistic action, realistic livelihood, realistic effort, realistic mindfulness, and realistic meditative concentration. These eight are grouped into the Three Spiritual or Higher Educations (*adhishiksha*): the Higher Educations of Justice or Morality, Meditation, and Wisdom. The Buddha found that he was unable to liberate people by the sheer force of his own wisdom or compassion. He could only help them to open their minds to a new understanding of self and world; he was thus forced to channel all his wisdom and compassion into education. So it is that the Buddhist tradition has always focused on spiritual education. The Buddhist monastery was not primarily a place of solitude, but was rather a place of cultivation. Wisdom, the engine of liberation, was cultivated at three levels, by learning, critical reflection, and contemplative penetration. First, one learned the Dharma, and one moved away from one's inherited deluded mind and into the Buddha mind by engaging with the enlightened speech recorded in the Sutras and their elucidations. Having understood the teachings at the surface level, one then had to pit one's instinctively deluded mind against the new, inferential, and relatively delicate understanding of the verbal Dharma, and struggle back and forth, cultivating doubt intensely through critical reflection that seeks to delve below the surface to find the deeper meaning. When this process is pursued with great energy and determination, critical reflection becomes penetrative concentration upon the cultivated, doubt-deepened understanding. This concentration draws energy away from instinctual misknowledge and pours it into the liberating insight of transcending wisdom until realistic understanding becomes intuitive and instinctual. Wisdom becoming intuitive, the self realizing its selflessness, and the person enjoying liberation all occur at the same time.

This kind of core curriculum was maintained for more than 10 centuries in hundreds of Buddhist monastic universities all over India. Many more developed in most other Asian countries, from Sri Lanka all the way to Japan. India's abundant economic situation, the special gentleness of its gracious ancient culture, and its tolerance of individual liberation were not easily duplicated in other countries where conditions were harsher. After the Indian classical civilization was utterly smashed by the Muslim invasions at the end of the first millennium CE, this curriculum was most faithfully

preserved and implemented in the high mountain refuge of Tibet, where so many of the great Indian masters fled. So it is that fragments of the full educational program of the global Buddhist movement has only begin to emerge fully since the opening of Tibet.

III. WHAT ARE WE DOING IN LIBERAL ARTS COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES TO PROVIDE HUMANISTIC EDUCATION? CAN IT BE FURTHERED BY DEVELOPING A MORE CONTEMPLATIVE ORIENTATION ON THE PART OF FACULTY AND STUDENTS?

Within our institutions of higher education, we attempt to liberate critical intellect, emotional stability, aesthetic sensitivity, and moral decency. Supposedly, natural sciences develop intelligence and knowledge of reality, social sciences develop awareness of the social dimension, and humanities provide emotional stability and aesthetic sensitivity and mold a sense of moral decency. Religion was originally driven away from the humanities—its content divided between literature, history, philology, and philosophy—because the scientific study of religion could not proceed effectively as long as it was dominated by a particular religion. This tradition was born of the Renaissance through Enlightenment's impulse toward awakening the full powers of the human. The new notion was that the purpose of human life is to move beyond the worship of a transcendent reality (conceived as a mysterious, all-powerful God) to the understanding of reality, assuming responsibility for the self and the environment, the whole existential situation. Therefore, it is only natural that religion should be regarded with suspicion by the academy. However, without the assistance of religion's deepest disciplines, contemplative and intellectual, the liberal arts and sciences are effectively prevented from becoming *liberating* arts and sciences. People are informed and certified but not properly prepared to exercise the responsibilities that humanism imposes on the individual. It is not that religion can make this contribution because of the efficacy of one belief or another, or one practice or another (including the practice of meditation). Religions concern themselves with humans' ultimate orientation, with their ultimate aims, and so possess a broad repertoire of arts and disciplines, enabling individuals to integrate their entire being—their physical, ethical, emotional, intellectual, and spiritual elements. Although no particular religion could, or should, dominate the academy again, the moral, psychological, contemplative, and philosophical disciplines embedded within various religions must be made available to faculty and students if education is to go beyond being merely informative and become transformative.

Fortunately, the *study of religion* in religious studies departments has returned to the humanistic universities, although it labors under the suspicious regard cast upon it by scientists (natural and social) and other

humanistic scholars strongly mindful of the prevailing canonization of secularity. Nevertheless, religion departments are able to restore to the curriculum the resources of the world's great spiritual traditions for self-exploration, self-cultivation, self-liberation, and self-integration. However, this must be carried out in an impeccable manner, not only because of the surrounding suspicion but also to ensure pluralism. No one religion can again become normative, its resources dominant, its approach controlling others, so a modern religion department must incorporate courses in all the major traditions.

In this context, we can approach with greater clarity the issue of contemplation within the university. We have seen that contemplation fits in the traditional inner science curriculum at the highest level through the cultivation of wisdom. Therefore, it is virtually indispensable if wisdom is to become fully transformative. The question, then, for academic institutions is not a question of adding a desirable frill to their vast smorgasbord of offerings. Rather, it is a matter of their effectively fulfilling their duty to provide a liberal—that is, a liberating and empowering—education. The ideal pedagogical process is first to learn something really well, using memorization and broad study; then to reflect upon it internally, assisted by energetic debate and discussion with teachers and other students; and finally to meditate upon the first tentative understandings in a sustained and focused way in order to develop insight to a transformative depth.

IV. WHAT ARE SOME PROGRAMS THAT WOULD HELP MAKE CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES A NORMAL PART OF A LIBERAL ARTS EDUCATION?

We should recognize that we already do provide contemplative opportunities to our students off campus in that we provide opportunities to study abroad in countries such as India, Thailand, Tibet, Nepal, and Sri Lanka. We are also aware, though institutionally it is an uneasy awareness, that our students join meditation centers and go on retreats offered by all religions (though primarily Eastern-based ones, which have become especially popular in this country). There are also student groups on campus, often fundamentalist ones, that offer opportunities for participation in their rituals, chanting sessions, prayer meetings, and confessional activities of various kinds.

Finally, on the therapeutic or athletic model, there are stress reduction clinics and yoga and tai chi classes in our physical education department. The point of reciting these ongoing activities is to remember, before we consider other methods, that we should reinforce those activities that are already performing valuable service.

Other strategies that might be developed include the following: (1) Encouraging the establishment of contemplative centers on campuses such as that proposed at Middlebury College by Steven Rockefeller. Harvard University's Center for the Study of World Religions was set up by its donors with such a purpose in mind, though significantly, its meditation room was eventually turned into a library. Colgate University's Chapel House was set up by the same donors and has provided some contemplative relief in its undergraduate center over the years. I know from personal experience that Amherst College, Williams College, Wesleyan University, Hampshire College, Mount Holyoke College, and Smith College have chapel spaces that can be expanded, pluralized, and contemplativized, depending on the availability of motivated faculty who are willing to provide leadership. Certainly at Columbia University, both St. Paul's Chapel and Earl Hall are used by a number of different groups for various kinds of contemplative practices. I'm fairly certain that every liberal arts college and university has available resources that can be used to support such practices. (2) Encouraging departments to introduce contemplative experience and expertise in whatever tradition as a recognized and rewarded accomplishment in the professor and the student. Just as knowledge of a particular text, ritual, doctrine, historical era, institution, and individual expressed in a thesis or other demonstration is evaluated and rewarded, so should knowledge of a particular meditation practice, gained by study of texts, exploration of institutions, and personal experience of the practice, expressed in a thesis or other demonstration, be evaluated and rewarded. (3) Encouraging individual scholars in the natural and social sciences to expand their research into physiological effects of various meditative disciplines. Professor Davidson at the University of Wisconsin has used magnetic resonant imagery to demonstrate certain well-developed mental capacities demonstrated by monks who are experienced in meditation. (4) Encouraging scholars in religious studies to research, translate, and publish more of the contemplative literature, technical as well as evocative, born of the contemplative disciplines. As I often point out, in the domain of contemplative development, we should not make the mistake of investing heavily in hardware possibilities and thus neglect the extraordinary software developed over millennia by contemplative cultures and traditions. (5) Encouraging media productions that inform about and instruct in the practice of contemplation, thereby reaching a wide audience, demystifying contemplation, and creating greater public acceptance of contemplation in the educational arena.

The opportunities are manifold for creative work in integrating contemplative practices into higher education, and we are grateful to the Center for Contemplative Mind in Society for the support it has given to faculty members at colleges and universities across the country to engage in this challenging work. We anticipate that their work will be multiplied in the

years ahead as our society becomes more aware of the critical need for such practices.

ROBERT THURMAN is the Jey Tsong Khapa Professor of Indo-Tibetan Buddhist Studies at Columbia University, and he also serves as the president of Tibet House. As a former Buddhist monk closely associated with the Dalai Lama, he has been instrumental in translating Buddhism for a Western audience. Among his many publications are *The Smile of the Buddha; Anger; The Central Philosophy of Tibet*; and the recently published *The Jewel Tree of Tibet*.

ANALYSIS

Analysis

Just as Ayora says in his book *Introducción a la Traductología,* "Traductology, as a discipline of linguistics, requires first of all the description of its problems, though it also needs a taxonomy of technical methods for the application of its principles." (Ayora, 1977, p. 255) Throughout the years schools of translation such as the American and the Canadian ones have stated a taxonomy and exposed the problems one encounters during a translation. The analysis of such problems is what turns a translation into a good one. Without jotting down our issues to later tackle them we would not be able to complete a faithful translation. There is always a process behind a good, satisfactory result.

This does not mean that the methods the translator used in this monograph are all encompassing and can provide us with the ability to understand and be able to deal with all of the possible bumps during the process, but if used correctly and in a well composed match with other methods proposed that have filled in the gaps that these methods have left, we will be able to provide a more complete analysis of the text.

Having already stated the two methods through which I will proceed to make this analysis, it is important to note that I will focus first on Vinay's and Darbelnet's taxonomy, followed by Malone's. The analysis is the highlight of this monograph. Here the taxonomies that have been mentioned before will be put into use. It is important to note that the purpose of this analysis is to go

deeper into the translation, since it will deal with the grammatical, synctactical and semantical aspects of the text.

Vinay and Darbelnet's Taxonomy

Borrowing

During the translation of this text, the translator encountered several terms that were not native to the source language. Since the subject of the articles is meditation, many terms came from Sanskrit and since they carry implications (that none the less are explained within the text) the translator decided to keep them since the original author had included them specifically for the connotation they have. Borrowing is also encompassed within Malone's *Matching* giving it the name of pre-fabricated Matching.

Target Language	*Source Language*
La palabra Meditación proviene de las palabras del Sanscrito **dhyana**, **bhavana**, e incluso **samadhi**, (p.T8)	Meditation translates from the Sanskrit **dhyana**, **bhavana** and even **samadhi**, *(p.S1765)*
Dhyana, Bhavana and Samadhi are terms from which (as the article explains) the word meditation comes from, and were added to this text by the author with the purpose of explaining them as terms rather than just as words. So, the translator decided to keep them and did not turn them into their equivalent translations.	

Target Language	Source Language
Cometer el error de invertir mucho en las posibilidades de **hardware** y así relegar el extraordinario **software** desarrollado durante milenios… (p. T17)	Make the mistake of investing heavily in **hardware** possibilities and thus neglect the extraordinary **software** developed over millennia… (p. S1773)
Hardware and software are two terms that have been accepted in the target language as technological terms. However, in this text they carry the meanings of tangible and intangible that, as the translator noticed, were the reasons why the author chose to use them, not as the technological terms they are. It is because of that stylistic choice of words that the translator decided to leave them as they are. Italics are used to distinguish the borrowed words in the source language from the rest of the text in the target language.	

Target Language	Source Language
Impartió la **Chaire Internationale** en el Collège de France (p.T6)	He held the **Chaire Internationale** at the Collegé of France (p. S1764)
Chaire Internationale is a title that is given to specific types of lectures taught at the Collegé de France. They invite a recognized guest in a specific field of knowledge to give a lecture at this university.	

Calque

The translator did not see herself in need to often use this procedure during this translation. The creation of a new translation for certain new terms was the main drive in the use of this procedure, therefore its use was not necessary. Malone includes this process within *Matching,* giving it the same name.

Target Language	*Source Language*
"**ciencias internas**" (como se les llama comúnmente) (p. T7)	"**inner sciences**," as they are often called, (p.S1765)
"Inner sciences" is a term that, in Spanish, is certainly new, as this is my proposal as translator. The translator was not able to find an official field translation of this term and as such transliterated the words and guided herself with the aid of suggestions obtained through the forum of the online dictionary *wordreference* and her findings during her research through the web.	

Target Language	*Source Language*
Aunque a nosotros, los **Euro-Americanos**, (p. T10)	Though we **Euro-Americans** like to think… (p. S1767)
This term is used to refer to Caucasian people in the translated article. The translator chooses to translate it directly into a *Calque* because to enclose all Caucasian people as Euro-Americans would be incorrect.	

Literal Translation

Literal translation was the most used technique in the translation of both articles. Malone also talks about this process and calls it *Equation*, enclosing it within the term *Matching*. In the translation of a technical text the use of literal translation is needed to transmit the impersonal aspect of the text, there are not many cultural aspects that need to be changed to make it understandable to the readers in the target language. For example, in a literary text, a poem, there might be a more imposing need to adapt. There are plenty of examples of this procedure throughout both articles; the following are just two of many.

Target Language	*Source Language*
Las raíces de este enfoque, las cuales insisten en que la educación debe enfocarse íntegramente en la persona, (p. T2)	The roots of this approach, which insists that education deal with the whole person, (p. S1761)
Here we have a case of complete concordance between our source language text and our target language translation.	

Target Language	*Source Language*
Cuando hablamos sobre reintroducir la vida contemplativa dentro de las humanidades, (p. T4)	When we talk about reintroducing the contemplative life into the humanities, (p. S1762)

Very similar to our example above, here we also have minimal changes in the resulting text in the target language with the addition of *la* necessary in Spanish before *humanidades* and the fusion of "we" and "talk" into *hablamos,* as well as the change in the order of words for "contemplative life" into *Vida contemplativa* needed to make the sentence more natural in the target language.

Transposition

This procedure consists of a grammatical change of words. It might be vital for the flow of a good translation to use this in order to make it sound natural in the target language text. *Substitution* is the name within which Malone, the other theorist that the translator deals with in this monograph, includes transposition, which is also enclosed within *Matching*. Transposition can be obligatory or optional, it is the decision of the translator to use it or not. In this translation there was no need for obligatory transpositions. However, here we have two examples of transposition used by the translator.

Target Language	Source Language
La búsqueda de la vida contemplativa usualmente se da **junto con** un sistema de creencias. (p. T4)	The pursuit of the contemplative life normally takes place within an **accompanying** belief system. (p. S1763)
In this example the word "accompanying" is functioning as a verb in the source language, for our translation we needed to convert it into a prepositional phrase *junto*	

con, The literal translation of "accompanying" would have been unnatural to the target language readers.

Target Language	Source Language
Tambien ha habido un incremento de interes en la religión, **y esto** se ha manifestado en la resurrección de tradiciones meditativas. (p. T1)	There has also been a growth of interest in religion, **which** has taken shape of reviving dormant meditative traditions. (p. S1760)
In this case "which" has been turned into *y esto*. The original function of "which" in the source text is that of a pronoun, referring to the previously stated "growth of interest". In the Spanish translation the function of *y esto* is that of a demonstrative phrase. It still refers to the previous *incremento de interés* but it has already turned the focus to the next clause.	

Modulation

Modulation was present in our text. In Spanish, the passive voice is not used often. Our source text in English tends to use it frequently. It is a necessary switch during the translation. The following examples are switches that were made but that were not necessary. The change of perspective can be optional or obligatory, but it must always have a purpose such as the examples below indicate.

Target Language	Source Language
También ha habido un incremento de interés en la religión, **y esto se ha manifestado en la resurrección de tradiciones meditativas** (p. T1)	There has also been a growth of interest in religion, **which has taken the shape of reviving dormant meditative traditions** (p. S1760)
Here we have a chunk of a sentence which contains a relative clause. "Which has taken shape" is modified to *y esto se ha manifestado*. To leave it as a subordinated sentence would have hindered the flow of the text in Spanish. The meaning remains the same even though the change of sentence type has been made.	

Target Language	Source Language
Su tolerancia a la liberación individual **difícilmente** fueron duplicados en otros países donde las condiciones eran más duras. (p. T14)	Its tolerance of individual liberation were **not easily** duplicated in other countries where conditions were harsher. (p. S1770)
In a literal translation into Spanish, translating "not easily" with *no fácilmente* might not sound as natural as *difícilmente* does in this case. The change in perspective in this example achieves a natural sounding sentence.	

Target Language	Source Language

Esta civilización fue marcada por la contemplación en todos los sentidos. (p. T7)	The contemplative marked that civilization in every way. (p. S1765)
Even though it has been previously stated that it is more frequent to find the passive voice in the English source text changing into an active voice when translated into Spanish, here there is an example of the opposite. It gave a certain emphasis to the fact the civilization had an important role in the expansion of the contemplative ideals.	

Equivalence

Equivalence deals with the translation of complete ideas from the source language to the target language. This technique consists mostly of the conveyance of idioms, proverbs, onomatopeic sounds, and slangs from one language to another. In Malone's list of procedures he adds equivalence to the processes that can happen within *Substitution*. During this translation the translator did not have to deal with any of them, since this was a rather technical translation, and the ideas were general and impersonal.

Adaptation

By its very nature as a technical text, the translator did not find many examples of this procedure but the one presented below. There are several

words that we can see throughout the translation that stayed in their original language, but that is due to the fact that these convey certain meanings in this specific field of Contemplative Education and as such the translator did not alter them in the resulting text to adapt them into the target language. This process is also included within *Substitution* in Malone's procedures.

Target Language	*Source Language*
Maharishi Mahesh Yogi de meditación trascendental ha intentado organizar **equipos de operaciones especiales** contemplativos para viajar a zonas de conflicto (p. T11)	Maharishi Mahesh Yogi from trascendental meditation has tried to organize contemplative **SWAT teams** to travel to trouble spots (p. S1768)
SWAT is an acronym for *Special Weapons and Tactics,* which translated literally would have confused the target language readership, and if left as an acronym it would not have meant anything to the readers as well. The translator decided to adapt it into "equipo de operaciones especiales" since it is a term that, although general, explains the nature of the team.	

Amplification

As it has been previously explained, Amplification refers to a change made by the translator in which a set of words is changed into the target language by explaining and amplifying the message or the term. In his taxonomy, Malone calls this process *Diffusion*. In this translation we can find several examples of

syntax and morphology changes, since they tend to be necessary changes when translating from one language to another.

Target Language	*Source Language*
Van desde las meditaciones básicas de atención plena con **escaneo corporal**, pasando por las meditaciones críticas de comprensión profunda … (p. T8)	They range from basic **scanning** mindfulness meditation, through critically penetrating insight meditations… (p. S1766)
For this example, the translator had to add *corporal* to the sentence due to the fact that it would otherwise have left the reader pondering "Scanning what?" A literal translation of the meditation type would not have sufficed to make our reader understand what it was about.	

Reduction

Reduction is a process that happens when an idea that previously consisted of several words in the source language is *reduced* to a fewer number of words*.* Malone also includes this process in his taxonomy as *condensation*. He, similarly to Vinay and Darbelnet, explains that it tends to be less frequent than other procedures due to the differences between languages. When translating from English into Spanish the resulting text tends to be longer than the original source text. In this translation the translator did not find terms that could be condensed into a less worded but more concise idea.

Joseph L. Malone's Taxonomy

Matching: Substitution and Equation

<u>Equation</u>

This procedure is similar to—if not quite the same— *Literal Translation* (Vinay and Darbelnet's taxonomy) that has been previously explained. This is Malone's equivalent for the minimal grammatical change during a translation task and it can be easily carried out from one language to another. The next is an example of equation:

Target Language	*Source Language*
en un marco social donde el *yo* y el *nosotros* vivan juntos en comunidad (p. T2)	In a social framework wherein I and we live together in community (p. S1761)
There is a minimal addition of the article "el" right before "nosotros" and "yo"; *I* and *we* are pronouns that are usually attached to a sentence as the subject of it. In this case they would not usually require the addition of "el" as a definite article; however, in this sentence they are not performing as the subject but as part of the complement of the sentence and as individual nouns which are being emphasized by adding the articles.	

<u>Substitution</u>

Substitution, encompasses several procedures for translating from Vinay and Darbelnet's list: transposition, equivalence, and *adaptation,* which have already been covered in the previous analysis of these procedures in Vinay's and Darbelnet's section. The following example of substitution might be considered an example of *transposition* (by Vinay and Darbelnet) as well:

Target Language	Source Language
esto debe ser llevado a cabo de una manera impecable, no sólo debido a que lo **rodea** la sospecha sino también para… (p.T15)	This must be carried out in an impeccable manner, not only because of the **surrounding** suspicion but also… (p. S1772)
In this example, the source text provides us with an adjective *surrounding* which is modifying the noun *suspicion*. For the translation into Spanish, the adjective was transformed into a verb, in which "rodea" becomes an action performed by "sospecha" in this case.	

Matching, in Malone's opinion, is a term that can encompass an alternation between equation and substitution. (Apart from the two previously stated procedures, matching also includes others), matching is generally used for stylistic purposes, and it can also cover what Vinay and Darbelnet call *borrowing* and *calque*. During the translation of the articles, the translator found herself in the need to use matching (*borrowing* and *calque*). In the

example below, the original author chose a specific set of words to refer to two aspects of contemplation that the translator chose to leave unchanged for stylistic reasons.

Target Language	Source Language
Cometer el error de invertir mucho en las posibilidades de *hardware* y así relegar el extraordinario *software* desarrollado durante milenios… (p. T17)	Make the mistake of investing heavily in hardware possibilities and thus neglect the extraordinary software developed over millennia… (p. S1773)
Hardware and software are two terms that have been accepted in the target language as technological terms. In this text they carry the connotations of tangible and intangible aspects about the topic, and that is why the translator decided to keep them in the final version in Spanish. This is due to the fact that these words have been accepted in the target language and the meaning can be clear to the target readers.	

Zigzagging: Divergence and Convergence

Divergence

Divergence happens when a term from our source language corresponds to two or more words in our target language, and as such the translator will have to choose which one fits better into the context presented. This tends to happen more when the target language is a romance language. These

languages have a wide vocabulary to design items. The following is an example of divergence.

Target Language	*Source Language*
Si le pido a un grupo de **estadounidenses** que mediten por razones culturales, religiosas, o espirituales, (p. T4)	If I ask a room full or **Americans** to meditate for cultural, religious, or spiritual reasons, (p. S1763)
If the translator were to translate the word *Americans* literally from the source language, the meaning of the word in the target language would convey the idea of a wider population than the one originally intended by the author. It diverges into a more specific term.	

Target Language	*Source Language*
Las ideas feministas, ecologistas y **autóctonas** han contribuido a este resurgimiento. (p. T1)	**Native**, feminist, and ecological thinking has contributed to this renaissance. (p. S1760)
Here we have the word *native*. The dictionary gives us several meanings for this word that could be fitting into the context of the text. The first is the word *native* as *indigenous beliefs*, the one the translator has chosen to use. The second one is *native* as in *innate*. (Wordreference, 2010). The two words that follow native (feminist and ecological) suggest the author was aiming at listing a series of minorities, and as such the translator used "autóctonas" as a translation.	

Convergence

Convergence is the exact opposite of divergence. When in the source language text the translator finds a term that has specific shades which cannot be reflected in the translated text due to a lack of vocabulary in the target language, the translator has to choose a term in the target language that might not have the specifics of the original word but that encloses within its meaning the idea the author was trying to convey. During the translation of this text the translator did not find a case in which it was necessary to use convergence, as Spanish has an extensive vocabulary.

Zigzagging

Zigzagging, in this case, refers to the two previous terms, convergence and divergence. Zigzagging is the action of going from convergence to divergence in order to convey the complete meaning of the original idea. Depending on the context and the intention of the author the translator has the option to choose. Divergence depends heavily on context and culture. Different from matching, this procedure does not go beyond convergence and divergence.

Recrescence: Amplification and Reduction

Amplification

Malone calls amplification the addition of extra information to explain the meaning of a word or idea that cannot convey the whole message to the target language readers by itself if translated literally. During this translation there was no need to add extra information in the form of Amplification. The translator decided to use diffusion rather than this procedure since the readership for which this article is intended already has knowledge of the subject and by adding extra information the text would have been made redundant. If the readership had no knowledge about the specific subject these articles dealt with, then the translator would be in need to use this procedure as a means to convey a clear message.

Reduction

Reduction is the process of omitting information that the translator does not see fit to include in the target language text. It might be due to the lack of sense the information has or because it is cumbersome to the targeted readers in the target language. The translator of these articles preferred to use condensation to deal with information that might not make sense to the readers than to omit it completely. The author of this paper believes the target readers might have an idea of the subject these articles deal with, but they are not experts in the field, hence, there are no redundant explanations within the text.

<u>Recrescense</u>

This term encloses the previous two terms, just like zigzagging does with divergence and convergence. The translator did not use either of them during the translation process.

Repackaging: Diffusion and Condensation

<u>Diffusion</u>

Diffusion is used to help explain the meaning of a term that otherwise would be difficult to translate; it is the process of expanding a term adding more words so that the readers in the target language can understand it. In this translation diffusion was used. There was the common grammatical diffusion necessary due to the nature of translating from one language to another (i.e. addition of articles) as well a diffusion of words from specific ideas related to the article's subject; this is what Vinay and Darbelnet would call amplification. In this example the diffusion is mild, but it is still an example of this procedure.

Target Language	Source Language

Van desde las meditaciones básicas de atención plena con **escaneo corporal**, pasando por las meditaciones criticas penetrativas de comprensión… (p. T10)	They range from basic **scanning** mindfulness meditation, through critically penetrating insight meditations… (p. S1766)
The word scanning" alone does not tell us what the meditation is about. It does not explain the purpose of the meditation and so, the readers might get confused. The translator decided to ad *corporal* to better represent what the meditation consists of.	

Condensation

Condensation is the opposite of the previous procedure, in which diffusion explains in more words a term that is difficult to translate. Condensation encloses a complete idea from our source language text in a word that has the same meaning and connotations of the original idea. It is a very rare happening, according to Malone; it is uncommon due to the cultural differences that are pervasive in between languages. It is referred by Vinay and Darbelnet as reduction.

Target Language	*Source Language*
Si le pido a un **grupo** de estadounidenses que mediten por razones culturales, religiosas, o espirituales,	If I ask **a room full** of Americans to meditate for cultural, religious, or spiritual reasons,
Here, the expression *a room full of Americans* can be literally translated into the target	

language; however, it would not sound natural in the target language. There is no such expression in Spanish that expresses the same intention as the one in the source language. As such, the translator decided to omit *a room full* and change it to *un grupo*.

Target Language	Source Language
la meditación se usa cada vez más para ayudar en la prevención y el **tratamiento de cardiopatía**, enfermedades autoinmunes, enfermedades pulmonares crónicas, (p. T5)	Meditation is used increasingly to help prevente and **treat heart disease**, autoinmune disorders, chronic long disease, (p. S1763)
In this example, "heart disease", a very general, two words term for afflictions to the heart was encompassed into just one word in the target language as "cardiopatía", which is a more technical term. The translator could have used *equation* as a means to translate this term. However, the translator chose this term for stylistic reasons.	

Repackaging

Just as zigzagging and recrescence, this method encompasses the two previous terms (diffusion and condensation) within itself and refers to a shifting in between them during the process of the translation. Repackaging was present during the translation of the text, diffusion being the process that almost by default can be found within it. Condensation, although rare, was somewhat used during the translation. Repackaging was chosen by the translator to compensate for missing meanings (diffusion) or to better fit

meanings within the translated text (condensation), instead of recrescence (amplification and reduction).

Reordering

Reordering refers to a necessary change of the word order. While doing literal translation (Vinay and Darbelnet's procedure) reordering is usually present. English and Spanish have different placements for certain word functions. Reordering is necessary for a good flow in the target language; it becomes evident when the translator does not make these changes. The resulting text will have a different flow and will sound foreign to the readers in the target language. The following is an example of reordering or syntactical change.

Target Language	Source Language
¿Qué es "esto" que sentimos que hemos perdido, que necesitamos más de él, que podemos mejorar nuestra salud con él, que podemos generar bienestar con él? (p. T7)	When we feel we've lost it, need more of it, can improve our health with it, can generate well-being with it, **what is this "it"?** (p. S1765)
It was necessary to reorder this part, since the target language did not allow the transition, which is natural for the source language question. The translator had to state what the question was about so he could then talk about it, for the sake of good structure and flow.	

CONCLUSION

Conclusion

The translation of both articles brought about challenges that made the translator discover some prevailing issues during the translation task. These matters are elucidated below:

The translator had issues with the transition of gerunds from English into their proper form in Spanish, which is a common fault in novice translators. It is of great importance not to let the source language hinder the resulting text in the target language. English interference consisted of transferring gerunds, punctuation standards, overuse of passive voice and faux amis.

It can also be stated that carrying out an analysis was of extraordinary help for the translator. Once the final version of the translation was finished some troublesome sentences were still considered not satisfying, but they were easily solved after completing the analysis, and the translator was able to offer an accurate translation that can be considered faithful to the original version in English. Both Vinay and Darbelnet's and Joseph Malone's taxonomies, the translator noticed, complemented each other when the analysis had to be made. Issues that would otherwise have been missed by using only one approach were taken into account by the other one. The translator believes that Malone's taxonomy encompasses a wider range of procedures and found it to be the most useful one when applied, since it also

included Vinay and Darbelnet's taxonomy within it, even though he named them differently.

The translator used several techniques—or procedures—during the task of translation. Literal translation was the one the translator found to be used the most; this is due to the fact that the translated texts are articles concerning a specific field and as such they are technical. For the translation of technical texts the use of literal translation is an obvious tendency, since phrases and words loaded with cultural aspects that would otherwise emerge in a different type of text are not commonly present here.

As a student of the English language, doing research to find the correct meaning to phrases and words that emerged from the source text was certainly a challenge and a rewarding process at the same time. The translator deduces that being a master in the topic that one is about to translate would undoubtedly make the task easier; however, it is not necessary for the translator to be an expert in it. What is necessary is to acquire a large vocabulary and a general idea about the topic the translator is about to translate, but, most importantly, have the aid of specialists in the field. The consultants that provided assistance throughout the process of this work cleared up several doubts and explained some vague concepts; without their help the task would not have been possible. In the end, the translator has gained new knowledge from the specialists about an area of study which she was not particularly experienced in; an added value to any translator in the making.

Doing a translation is not an easy task. The translator has reached this conclusion after having experienced the series of actions involved to achieve a proper translation. One should take into consideration many aspects regarding both the target and the source languages: cultural background, nuances and peculiarities of the language in a particular context, register employed in the text, among other characteristics that might make the difference between a good target language version and a bad one. All these aspects were born in mind while undertaking the translation from English into Spanish for this study. Therefore, it can be claimed that the resulting translation in this monograph can now be used for the purpose it was originally intended.

Translators have to be passionate about their work. In spite of the fact that the translator had never completed a technical translation work of this length and that the process was exhausting at times, it was a stimulating and rewarding experience. One has to be enthusiastic about learning more about the languages and cultures usually involved in everyday practice. On this occasion, the Contemplative Education topic yielded questions the translator had to answer by researching and asking specialists and could not quit in her attempt.

If translators surrender to the difficulties easily, they will most likely never finish translating a text. Completing the translation product and being certain that it is a precise one is gratifying. After being exposed to this discipline, the

translator—and author of this work—is convinced now that she can pursue a

career in Translation and is willing to do so in the future.

References

Duff, A. (1989). *Translation.* UK: Oxford University Press.

El mundo Dictionary. (n.d.) Retrieved December 01, 2009, from http://www. elmundo.es/diccionarios/

Fawcett, P. (1997). *Translation and Language.* Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.

García-Yebra, V. (1989). *En torno a la traducción.* Madrid: Editorial Gredos.

García-Yebra V. (1994). *Traducción: Historia y Teoría.* Madrid: Editorial Gredos S.A.

Garrison Institute Report: Contemplation and education. A survey of programs using contemplative techniques in K-12 educational settings: A mapping report. (2005) (pp.4-20)

Haywood, L., Hervey S., & Higgins. I. (1995) *Thinking Spanish Translation a Course in Translation Method: Spanish to English*. United Kingdom: Routledge

Langer, E. J. (1997). *The Power of Mindful Learning.* US: Addison Wesley Publishing.

López Guix J. G. & Wilkinson J. M. (1999). *Manual de Traducción.* España: Editorial Gedisa S.A.

Mackler, J.M., Peña A., & Camacho K. (2008) *What is contemplative education and what are some ways to introduce it into higher education in Mexico?* Universidad de Quintana Roo. Mexico.

Peña, A. (2007) *Análisis de estrategias utilizadas en la traducción del inglés al español de dos cuentos cortos de Dorothy Parker, "NewYork to Detroit" y "The Lovely Leave".* (Masters dissertation). Universidad Autónoma de Guadalajara. México.

Munday, J.S. (2009). *Systems in Translation.* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from www.leeds.ac.uk/spanport/staff/jeremy_munday.htm (November 17, 2010)

Newmark P. (2006). *Manual de Traducción.* España: Ediciones Cátedra

Real Academia Española. Retrieved December 01, 2009, from http://www.rae.es/rae.html

Robinson Douglas. (1997). *Becoming a translator.* Padstow, Cornwall: TJ International Ltd.

Shapiro, S.L., Brown, K.W., Astin, & J.A. (2008). *Prepared for the Center for Contemplative Mind in Society.* Retrived November 13, 2010, from http://www.contemplativemind.org/programs/academic /MedandHigherEd.pdf

Sofer M. (2002). *The Translator's Handbook.* Rocville, Maryland: Schreiber Publishing

Stock Brian. (2006). the Contemplative Life and the Teaching of the Humanities. *Teachers College Record.* Volume 108, Number 9. pp1760-1764

Susan B. And André L. (1990). Translation, History and Culture. *Teachers College Record*. Great Britain: Pinter Publishers

Thesaurus. (n.d.) Retrieved December 01, 2009 http://thesaurus.reference.com/

 Thurman Robert A. F.(2006). Meditation and Education: India, Tibet, and Modern America. *Teachers College Record.* Volume 108, Number 9. pp 1765-1774

Vázquez-Ayora G. (1977). *Introducción a la Traductología.* USA: Georgetown University Press.

Vinay, J. P., & Darbelnet, J. (1995). Methods of Translation. Comparative Stylistics of French and English: a methodology for translation (1.4.1). Retrieved from http://books.google.com.mx/books?id=I06D6gU45sC&printsec =frontcover&dq=Vinay+and+Darbelnet&hl=es&ei=JK7sTI6UIYz4sAPL05nKD w&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CCUQ6AEwAA#v=one page&q=calque&f=false

Wordreference. (n.d.) Retrieved December 01, 2009, from http://www.wordreference.com/es/